### SUMMARY REPORT OF INVESTIGATION

### I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Date / Time of Incidents: (1) August 25, 2017, at approximately 7:41 p.m.

(2) August 25, 2017, between 7:41 p.m. and 9:21 p.m.

Locations of Incidents: (1) 3123 W. 25<sup>th</sup> Street, Chicago, Illinois

(2) 3315 W. Ogden Avenue, Chicago, Illinois

Date of COPA Notification: September 18, 2017

Body-worn camera ["BWC"] footage shows a CPD captain striking the Complainant six times, apparently in the back, as the captain and other CPD members struggled to place the Complainant, in handcuffs at an arrest scene. The Complainant alleges that the captain's use of force at the arrest scene was excessive. The Complainant also alleges post-arrest misconduct, claiming that the captain and a CPD sergeant beat and kicked him at the CPD's 010<sup>th</sup> District Station during the Complainant's processing. COPA has determined that the captain's use of force at the arrest scene was objectively reasonable. COPA has also determined that the Complainant's allegations of post-arrest misconduct are false.

#### II. INVOLVED PARTIES

Involved Member #1: Joseph Brennan
Star #25, Employee ID#

Date of Appointment: November 22, 1993

Rank: Captain / Unit: 010 DOB: , 1968

M/W

Involved Member #2: Peter Chambers

Star #1076, Employee ID# Date of Appointment: April 28, 2008

Rank: Sergeant / Unit: 010 DOB: 1984

M/W

Involved Individual

#1:

DOB: , 1985 M/WH

## III. ALLEGATIONS

Member	Allegation	Finding
Captain Brennan	1. On August 25, 2017, at approximately 7:41 p.m., at	UNFOUNDED
	3123 W. 25 <sup>th</sup> Street, Chicago, Illinois, the accused used	
	excessive force in effecting the arrest of the Complain-	
	ant, in violation of Rules 1, 8 and 9 of the CPD Rules of	
	Conduct.	
	2. On August 25, 2017, between 7:41 p.m. and 9:21	UNFOUNDED
	p.m., at 3315 W. Ogden Avenue, Chicago, Illinois, the	
	accused used excessive force upon the Complainant	
	while the Complainant was in police custody, in viola-	
	tion of Rules 1, 8 and 9 of the CPD Rules of Conduct.	
Sergeant Chambers	1. On August 25, 2017, between 7:41 p.m. and 9:21	UNFOUNDED
	p.m., at 3315 W. Ogden Avenue, Chicago, Illinois, the	
	accused used excessive force upon the Complainant	5
	while the Complainant was in police custody, in viola-	
	tion of Rules 1, 8 and 9 of the CPD Rules of Conduct.	

### IV. APPLICABLE RULES AND LAWS

### Rules

- 1. Rule 1, CPD Rules of Conduct (prohibiting violation of any law)
- 2. Rule 8, CPD Rules of Conduct (prohibiting maltreatment)
- 3. Rule 9, CPD Rules of Conduct (prohibiting unjustified verbal and physical altercations)

## General Orders

- 1. G03-02, Use of Force Guidelines (Effective October 1, 2002 through October 15, 2017)
- 2. G03-02-02, Force Options (Effective January 1, 2016 through October 15, 2017)

### Federal Laws

1. U.S. Constitution, Fourth Amendment

### State Laws

1. 720 ILCS 5/7-5

### V. INVESTIGATION 1

### A. Digital Evidence

1. COPA obtained BWC Video Footage depicting the Complainant's arrest.<sup>2</sup>

Sgt. Peter Chambers' BWC footage depicts a traffic stop occurring in the 2600 block of South Whipple Street. It shows the Complainant run from the stop into a nearby shopping mall. It then shows Sgt. Chambers chase the Complainant through that mall and into an adjacent parking lot, where the Complainant then enters the back seat of an occupied motor vehicle. The footage then shows the vehicle's occupant get out of the car, and it shows the Complainant also leave the car and continue his flight on foot through the parking lot, with Sgt. Chambers giving chase. It then shows the Complainant push Sgt. Chambers, continue to run, and enter the passenger front seat of another occupied motor vehicle. The footage then depicts the Complainant drive that car northbound through the parking lot, leaving the car's former occupant behind. It then shows Sgt. Chambers relocate on foot to the back of a residence located at 3123 W. 25th Street, where he enters the building's basement with other CPD members. The footage then shows CPD members locate the Complainant hiding under a bed. It then shows CPD members struggle with the Complainant for approximately fifty seconds, first in pulling the Complainant out from under the bed by his arms, then in gaining control of the Complainant's left wrist and hand for handcuffing, and then in gaining control of the Complainant's right wrist and hand for handcuffing. Approximately forty seconds into the struggle depicted by the footage, the Complainant can be heard shouting. "I'm gonna give it up, sir, I promise" as a CPD member shouts, "Give up your hands." The footage shows that Captain Brennan is atop the Complainant at this point in the struggle, and that the Complainant is apparently face down and prone. Captain Brennan is in uniform, wearing a white shirt. The footage then shows Captain Brennan strike the Complainant with his right hand, in two bursts of three strikes each, with a slight pause between bursts. The footage does not show where the strikes land. The footage shows the struggle end immediately after the second burst of strikes. with the CPD members handcuffing the Complainant after having gained control of his hands. The footage then shows CPD members stand the Complainant up, and it shows them walk the Complainant towards the basement exit.

CPD Officer Joel Soto's BWC footage depicts CPD members walking the Complainant from the arrest scene and out of the basement without incident. Captain Brennan is not one of the members depicted in escorting the Complainant from the arrest scene.

CPD Officer Jorge Reyes' BWC footage depicts a brief transport of the Complainant from a place near the arrest scene address to a location about one minute away, apparently for purposes of a show-up. The Complainant cannot be seen in the footage, but he can be heard from the backseat, fully conscious and calm, variously complaining about having difficulty breathing and about the tightness of his handcuffs, asking Officer Reyes to open the car's windows, stating, "I promise, I'll be good."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>COPA conducted a thorough and complete investigation. The following is a summary of the material evidence gathered and relied upon in our analysis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Attachment #46 is a catalogue of that footage, which comprises twenty-five separate videos, captured by BWCs worn by sixteen different officers.

## 2. Photographs





Figure #1

Figure #2

Figures ## 1 and 2 above are the Complainant's arrest photographs.<sup>3</sup>

### **B.** Documentary Evidence

- 1. On September 18, 2017, COPA received a one-page Letter from the Complainant dated September 11, 2017.<sup>4</sup> In non-verbatim summary of the material parts of that letter, the Complainant stated that he was in custody at Cook County Jail; that he had been falsely accused of vehicular hijacking, aggravated battery of a police officer, and residential burglary; that he had been beaten by an unnamed male arresting officer in the 010<sup>th</sup> District lockup; that he had been subsequently treated at Mt. Sinai hospital for a shoulder sprain and avulsion fracture, and that he gave Mt. Sinai staff a false name.
- 2. The **Arrest Report** relating to the event<sup>5</sup> shows that the CPD arrested the Complainant at 3123 W. 25<sup>th</sup> Street in Chicago on August 25, 2017 at 7:41 p.m.<sup>6</sup> In the narrative portion, Sgt. Chambers describes the traffic stop that initiated the event, as well as the foot pursuit and carjacking that ensued. He also describes the Complainant's arrest, stating

Arrestee was located hiding underneath a bed. Arrestee continued to refuse verbal commands, stiffened, and held his right arm under his body as officers attempted to place him into custody. Capt. Brennan #25 then used several closed fist strikes to the large muscle mass (middle back) in order to gain compliance. A/O's were

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Attachment #15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>Attachment #4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>Attachment #5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup><u>Id.</u>, p. 1.

eventually able to place arrestee into custody. . Arrestee sustained minor injuries during arrest procedure.  $^7$ 

3. The **Original Incident Case Report** relating to the event<sup>8</sup> largely duplicates the event's Arrest Report. Sgt. Chambers describes the event in the report's narrative portion, in pertinent part, as follows:

[O]ffender was located hiding underneath a bed in the front bedroom. Offender was ordered out from under the bed, to which he refused to comply. Officers then attempted to extract him from under the bed. Offender continued to resist officers' attempts to remove him, by holding onto the bedframe. Offender was eventually removed, but refused to comply officers' demands to give his hands for cuffing. Capt. Brennan #25 then used several closed fist strikes to the large muscle mass (middle back) in order to gain compliance. Offender continued to refuse and resist officers, by remaining stiff and keeping his right hand under his chest. Officers were eventually able to gain control of both of offender's hands and placed him into custody... Offender sustained minor injuries during arrest procedure.<sup>9</sup>

- 4. Captain Brennan submitted a **Tactical Response Report** ["TRR"]. <sup>10</sup> In it, Captain Brennan reported, among other things, that the Complainant did not follow verbal direction, that the Complainant pulled away, and that the Complainant had committed a battery to Sgt. Chambers. <sup>11</sup> Captain Brennan further reported that he employed closed hand strikes to the Complainant's pressure sensitive areas in response to the Complainant's actions. <sup>12</sup>
- 5. **Mt. Sinai Hospital Medical Records** reflecting treatment rendered to the Complainant while in CPD custody<sup>13</sup> show that hospital staff treated the Complainant on the evening of August 25 through the early morning hours of August 26.<sup>14</sup> According to the records, the Complainant told hospital staff that he had been tackled and punched several times in the face and that he had right shoulder pain.<sup>15</sup> Hospital staff noted multiple superficial abrasions to the Complainant's left forehead and periorbital area, and they further noted that they had performed a neurological examination showing no need for a head CT scan.<sup>16</sup> According to the records, the Complainant denied losing consciousness.<sup>17</sup> A report of radiological imaging tests of the Complainant's right shoulder showed no evidence of an acute fracture.<sup>18</sup> Hospital staff discharged the Complainant with a sling and ibuprofen.<sup>19</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>Id., p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup>Attachment #6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup>Id., p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup>Attachment #11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup><u>Id.</u>, p. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup>Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Attachment #14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> <u>Id.</u>, p. 2-3

<sup>15&</sup>lt;u>Id.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup><u>Id.</u>, p. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup>Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup><u>Id.</u>, p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup>Id., p. 4.

#### C. Interviews

1. The Complainant, gave a Digital Audio Recorded Interview on December 1, 2017.<sup>20</sup> Except where indicated by block quotations or quotation marks, the following is a non-verbatim summary of the material parts of that interview.

The Complainant stated that he was handcuffed without incident at the time of his arrest, after he voluntarily crawled out from under the bed where he was hiding immediately after having been instructed by CPD members to do so.<sup>21</sup> He further stated that Captain Brennan punched and kicked him at the arrest scene after he was handcuffed.<sup>22</sup> More specifically, the Complainant stated

Captain Brennan, he put it in his police report that he struck me several times, because I was resisting arrest. And, I'm like, how am I resisting arrest, if yous (sic) found me under the floor, hiding under the bed, you know. And, when, when I heard loud police radios, in the basement, I, uh, I felt safe, you know, because I figured like there was a lot of witnesses, you know. So, like, they ain't shoot me, they're not gonna beat me, you know. But, as soon as they told me, 'Get up from under the bed,' I came out willfully, and they, he handcuffed me without incident, you know. Like, I, I -- he handcuffed me, and then, as soon as he handcuffed me, Captain Brennan started kicking me in my ribs, and then, he started punching me.<sup>23</sup>

The Complainant also specifically stated

So, when they seen my feet popping out from under the bed, so they told me to come out. So, I came out, willfully. And, when I came out, I, they, uh, Captain Brennan, he, uh, he handcuffed me, with - without incident. I did not, I did not try to resist, or none of that. Everybody's there. Why would I try to resist, if I know that, that they're gonna get me anyways. I can't go nowhere, you know. But, now that there's a lot of people there, I feel more safe. I don't have to be scared of getting beaten, or getting shot at, you know. But, either way, regardless, he still beat me. He beat me while I was in handcuffs.<sup>24</sup>

The Complainant further stated that Captain Brennan escorted him from the arrest scene, slamming his face "against everything" and slamming his body against stairs along the way.<sup>25</sup> He further claimed that other, unnamed CPD members then slammed his face on the door frame of a transport vehicle, causing him to blackout in the car's backseat.<sup>26</sup> He stated that he was then taken to the 010<sup>th</sup> District Station, where Captain Brennan, Sgt. Chambers, and a third CPD member were

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup>Attachment #65 is an audio recording of that interview; Attachment #82 is a transcript.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>Attachment #82, p. 10, line 15, through p. 11, line 7; p. 33, line 15, through p. 34, line 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Id., p. 11, lines 1 – 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup>Id., p. 10, line 15, through p. 11, line 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup>Id., p. 33, line 15, through p. 34, line 3.

 $<sup>^{25}</sup>$ Id., p. 17, lines 16 - 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup><u>Id.</u>, p. 18, lines 2 -3.

waiting for him outside.<sup>27</sup> The Complainant further stated that Captain Brennan and Sgt. Chambers took him to a small room where they beat him about the face and forehead.<sup>28</sup> He described Captain Brennan's clothing as "all black."<sup>29</sup>

gave a Digital Audio Recorded Interview on January 23, 2018.<sup>30</sup> was in the 010<sup>th</sup> District Station during part of at the time of the Complainant's processing – she had been arrested at 6:12 p.m. that evening.<sup>31</sup> Except where indicated by quotation marks, the following is non-verbatim summary of the material parts of that interview.

stated that she observed CPD members take the Complainant into and out of the 010<sup>th</sup> District Station's search room.<sup>32</sup> stated that she did not see the inside of the search room.<sup>33</sup> However, stated that she heard "tussling" from inside the search room, <sup>34</sup> and that she heard the Complainant yell, from the search room, "Ah, let me go. Stop hitting me. Let me go."<sup>35</sup> denied that the Complainant's face bore the injuries depicted in his arrest photographs prior to his entry into the search room.<sup>36</sup> also denied that there was anything wrong with the Complainant's face at the time that he came out of the search room.<sup>37</sup> According to the Complainant's facial injuries revealed themselves only later, and she therefore concluded that the Complainant must have sustained those injuries while he was in the search room.<sup>38</sup>

3. Sgt. Peter Chambers gave Digital Audio Recorded Statements on May 3 and 16, 2017.<sup>39</sup> Prior to the commencement of his statement, Sgt. Chambers viewed his BWC footage that is described in Section V.A.1. above. Except where indicated by quotation marks, the following is a non-verbatim summary of the material parts of Sgt. Chambers' statement.

At the arrest scene, Sgt. Chambers observed fellow members pull the Complainant out from under the bed, and he observed them then lose their grip of the Complainant's right arm. He observed the Complainant then place his right arm under his torso while he was prone on his stomach. Sgt. Chambers was then concerned that the Complainant might be concealing a weapon under his body. Sgt. Chambers saw Captain Brennan strike the Complainant in the Complainant's shoulder area on his right side. Sgt. Chambers brought the Complainant into the 010<sup>th</sup> District Station and then took him into the Station's search room, which is contained within the Station's processing room. CPD Officer David Cato was with Sgt. Chambers and the Complainant in the search room during

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup>Id., p. 41, line 20, through p. 42, line 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup><u>Id.</u>, p. 9, line 19; p. 42, lines 1 -5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup>Id., p. 36, lines 10 - 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup>Attachment #78 is an audio recording of that interview; Attachment #80 is a transcript.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup>Attachment #83 ( Arrest Report).

 $<sup>^{32}</sup>$ Attachment #80, p. 7, lines 14 – 19.

 $<sup>^{33}</sup>$ Id., p. 15, lines 7 – 9.

 $<sup>^{34}</sup>$ Id., p. 16, lines 7 – 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup>Id., p. 25, lines 18 19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup><u>Id.</u>, p. 21, lines 13 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup>Id., p. 7, lines 17 19, p. 9, lines 22 - 24, p. 12, line 12.

 $<sup>^{38}</sup>$ Id., p. 21, lines 15 – 22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup>By agreement between COPA and Sgt. Chambers, his statement was adjourned and recommenced subsequently, because Sgt. Chambers had not been notified that he would be giving his statement in a capacity as a witness as well as in the capacity as an accused. Attachments ##88-90 are audio recordings of Parts 1-3 (of 3) that statement, respectively.

the time that Sgt. Chambers was in the search room with the Complainant. Sgt. Chambers was never alone with the Complainant in the search room. Other CPD members were just outside the search room for security purposes. The search room door was left ajar so that other CPD members could enter if needed. No other CPD members did in fact enter. The Complainant was in the search room for approximately five minutes. While in the search room, the Complainant yelled to Sgt. Chambers that he would "kick his ass." He also yelled that he was being beaten. Sgt. Chambers denied that he or anyone else ever beat, punched or kicked the Complainant. Sgt. Chambers searched the Complainant in the search room, and he then brought him into the interview room, where he handcuffed him to the wall. Sgt. Chambers remembered having no further contact with the Complainant after that. Sgt. Chambers spoke to Captain Brennan in the 010<sup>th</sup> District Station's tact office and in its watch commanders' office so that Captain Brennan could provide Sgt. Chambers with information needed for reports. Sgt. Chambers could not account for all of Captain Brennan's whereabouts during the time that the Complainant was in the Station. He saw no one else enter the interview room with the Complainant.

4. Captain Joseph Brennan gave a Digital Audio Recorded Statement on July 6, 2017.<sup>40</sup> Prior to the commencement of his statement, Captain Brennan viewed Sgt. Chambers' BWC footage that is described in Section V.A.1. above. Except where indicated by quotation marks, the following is a non-verbatim summary of the material parts of Captain Brennan's statement.

Captain Brennan was on patrol near the arrest scene when he heard a radio broadcast of Sgt. Chambers' chase. Captain Brennan observed the Complainant drive down an alley, exit his car and run into the basement residence at 3123 W. 25th Street. Captain Brennan followed the Complainant there, where he and other CPD members entered the residence. Captain Brennan and other CPD members found the Complainant hiding under a bed. Captain Brennan ordered the Complainant to come out and show his hands. CPD members then pulled the Complainant out from under the bed by his arms, and they placed a handcuff on one of the Complainant's wrists. Captain Brennan was then atop the Complainant, who was then face down and prone with his nonhandcuffed arm under his body. Captain Brennan told the Complainant to show his hands, and he then applied three closed-fist strikes to the Complainant's back near his shoulder. Captain Brennan repeated his command for the Complainant to show his hands, and then applied three additional closed-fist strikes to the Complainant's back near his shoulder. The Complainant then submitted his free hand for handcuffing. At the time, Captain Brennan had been informed via radio that the Complainant battered Sgt. Chambers and that he committed the offense of carjacking; he did not know and could not see whether the Complainant was armed or if he had access to a weapon. Captain Brennan had no contact with the Complainant apart from his contact with him at the arrest scene.

#### VI. ANALYSIS

### A. Allegation #1 against Captain Brennan

Allegation #1 against Captain Brennan involves the Complainant's contention that Captain Brennan used excessive force in effecting the Complainant's arrest. That Captain Brennan used

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup>Attachment #98 is an audio recording of that statement.

force in effecting the Complainant's arrest is not disputed, so the central inquiry in resolving the allegation must be whether the force used by Captain Brennan was "objectively reasonable." <sup>41</sup>

Application of that "objective reasonableness" test requires careful attention to the facts and circumstances of the case, including the severity of the crimes at issue, whether the Complainant posed an immediate safety threat, and whether he was actively resisting arrest or attempting to evade arrest by flight.<sup>42</sup> Captain Brennan's use of force must be judged based on the totality of the circumstances known by him at the time and from the perspective of a reasonable law enforcement officer at the scene.<sup>43</sup> Following those standards, COPA finds that Captain Brennan's use of force in effecting the Complainant's arrest was indeed objectively reasonable, and that, therefore, the Complainant's allegation that Captain Brennan used excessive force in effecting that arrest is false.

As described by Captain Brennan during his statement, the facts and circumstances that he knew at the relevant time included his inability to see if the Complainant had access to a weapon, whether under his body or in the space under the bed where he was hiding -- circumstances confirmed by Sgt. Chambers' BWC footage indicating that the Complainant posed a potential safety threat. The relevant facts and circumstances that Captain Brennan described in his statement also included his understanding that the Complainant committed the crimes of carjacking and battery of a police officer, which Captain Brennan derived from Sgt. Chambers' radio broadcast of the Complainant's flight from arrest as it occurred. The relevant facts and circumstances also included the Complainant's active resistance at the arrest scene, which is shown by Sgt. Chambers' BWC footage depicting CPD members pulling the Complainant from under the bed against his will, as well as the Complainant's refusal to submit to handcuffing voluntarily.

BWC footage shows that Captain Brennan delivered his strikes in two separate short bursts, and that Captain Brennan discontinued those strikes immediately upon the Complainant's submission to arrest. Captain Brennan's contention that he applied the strikes to the Complainant's upper back is consistent with BWC footage, though the footage does not show precisely where Captain Brennan's strikes landed upon the Complainant's body. The absence of any significant head injury to the Complainant also supports that contention. Captain Brennan's use of force can therefore be fairly described as a use of "stunning" techniques - diffused-pressure striking intended to increase control by disorienting a subject and by interfering with his ability to resist - techniques that were expressly permitted by an applicable CPD directive that was in effect at the time.<sup>44</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup>Graham v. Connor, 490 U.S. 386, 396-97 (1989); CPD General Order G03-02, Use of Force Guidelines, Section III.C (effective September 23, 2002 through October 15, 2017).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> 490 U.S. at 396; CPD General Order G03-02, Use of Force Guidelines, Section III.C.1 (effective September 23, 2002 through October 15, 2017)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> 490 U.S. at 396-97; CPD General Order G03-02, Use of Force Guidelines, Section III.C.2 (effective September 23, 2002 through October 15, 2017); 720 ILCS 5/7-5 (a peace officer "is justified in the use of any force which he reasonably believes to be necessary to effect the arrest and of any force which he reasonably believes to be necessary to defend himself or another from bodily harm while making the arrest").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup>See CPD General Order G03-02-02, Force Options, Section IV.B.4.a (effective January 1, 2016 through October 15, 2017).

All of the above demonstrate that the force used by Captain Brennan in effecting the Complainant's arrest was objectively reasonable and that, therefore, the Complaint's allegation of excessive arrest-scene force by Captain Brennan must be rejected as UNFOUNDED.

# B. Allegation #2 against Captain Brennan and Allegation #1 against Sgt. Chambers

Allegation #2 against Captain Brennan and Allegation #1 against Sgt. Chambers involve the Complainant's claim that Captain Brennan and Sgt. Chambers beat and kicked him while he was in custody at the 010<sup>th</sup> District Station.

COPA rejects the allegation against Captain Brennan as UNFOUNDED. There are numerous reasons compelling COPA to discredit the Complainant's allegation, and to discredit the Complainant generally. A number of the Complainant's contentions concerning his alleged mistreatment by Captain Brennan have been proven false by BWC footage, including the Complainant's contention that Captain Brennan was wearing all black during the events in question, 45 the Complainant's contention that he crawled out from beneath the bed where he was hiding voluntarily after having been so directed by the CPD, 46 the Complainant's contention that Captain Brennan escorted him from the arrest scene, mistreating him along the way.<sup>47</sup> and the Complainant's contention that Captain Brennan was one of the CPD members who was waiting for the him outside the 010<sup>th</sup> District Station after his arrest.<sup>48</sup> Other evidence demonstrates that the Complainant cannot be credited, including the Complainant's initial letter to COPA, in which the Complainant alleged that he was mistreated by one officer only, 49 the Complainant's admission, in that letter, that he had provided a false name upon his arrest, 50 and the Complainant's contention that he blacked out in a CPD transport car's backseat, which cannot be reconciled with his statement to Mr. Sinai Hospital staff in which he denied that he had lost consciousness.<sup>51</sup> By contrast with the Complainant's statements, Captain Brennan's denial that he ever saw the Complainant after he was removed from the arrest scene is credible, and is supported by that part of Sgt. Chambers' statement in which he denied that Captain Brennan was one of the CPD members who searched and processed the Complainant at the 010<sup>th</sup> District Station post-arrest.

COPA likewise rejects the Complainant's allegation against Sgt. Chambers as UN-FOUNDED. As noted above, the Complainant has been proven to be entirely unreliable. By contrast, Sgt. Chambers' accounts of the events, set out in his post-arrest reports and in his statement, are entirely credible in that they are consistent and largely supported by BWC footage. Sgt. Chambers' explanation that the Complainant sustained his facial and shoulder injuries during the arrest is supported by BWC footage showing that CPD members had to forcibly pull the Complainant out from beneath the bed where he was hiding and showing that the Complainant was face down throughout his resistance to handcuffing at the arrest scene. Furthermore, arrest photographs and medical records showing the absence of serious facial injuries make the Complainant's claim

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup>See Attachment #82, p. 36, lines 10 - 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup>See id., p. 11, lines 1-4; p. 35, lines 1-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup>See id., p. 17, lines 16 – 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup>See id., p. 41, line 20, through p. 42, line 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup>Attachment #4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup>Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Id., p. 18, lines 2 -3.

that he was beaten all the more unbelievable. And though denied that the Complainant's face bore the injuries depicted in arrest photographs prior to entering the 010<sup>th</sup> District Station's search room, she also denied that there was anything wrong with the Complainant's face at the time that he came out of the search room. She claimed that the Complainant's facial injuries revealed themselves only later, and she therefore concluded that the Complainant must have sustained those injuries while in the search room, drawing that conclusion without knowing anything about the circumstances of the Complainant's arrest. For those reasons, Ms. observations concerning the Complainant's facial injuries do not show that the Complainant sustained his injuries at the 010<sup>th</sup> District Station but not at the arrest scene. Finally, that Ms. heard the Complainant yelled "Stop hitting me!" from the search room does not give any credence to the Complainant's allegations given the Complainant's proven lack of veracity respecting the events.

### VII. CONCLUSION

Based on the analysis set forth above, COPA makes the following findings:

Officer	Allegation	Finding
Captain Brennan	1. On August 25, 2017, at approximately 7:41 p.m., at 3123 W. 25 <sup>th</sup> Street, Chicago, Illinois, the accused used excessive force in effecting the arrest of the Complain-	UNFOUNDED
	ant, in violation of Rules 8 and 9 of the CPD Rules of Conduct.	
	2. On August 25, 2017, between 7:41 p.m. and 9:21 p.m., at 3315 W. Ogden Avenue, Chicago, Illinois, the accused used excessive force upon the Complainant while the Complainant was in police custody, in violation of Rules 8 and 9 of the CPD Rules of Conduct.	UNFOUNDED
Sergeant Chambers	1. On August 25, 2017, between 7:41 p.m. and 9:21 p.m., at 3315 W. Ogden Avenue, Chicago, Illinois, the accused used excessive force upon the Complainant while the Complainant was in police custody, in violation of Rules 8 and 9 of the CPD Rules of Conduct.	UNFOUNDED

Approvéd:

Erica Sangster
Acting Deputy Chief Administrator

8 8 18

# Appendix A

# Assigned Investigative Staff

Squad#:11Investigator:Francis TigheSupervising Investigator:Brian DollarActing Deputy Chief Administrator:Erica Sangster