

SUMMARY REPORT OF INVESTIGATION

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Date/Time of Incident:	Various Dates and Times
Location of Incident:	██████████ Chicago, IL ██████████ - ██████████ Gurnee, Illinois
Date of COPA Notification:	January 27, 2018
Time of COPA Notification:	9:08AM

██████████ and Officer Hutchinson were ██████████ for approximately three years and have two children in common. Mrs. ██████████ reported that Officer Hutchinson had been physically abusive toward her prior to and throughout their ██████████. She alleged that she sustained serious injuries, including a fractured ankle and thumb, as a result of his abuse. COPA finds the allegations against Officer Hutchinson are Sustained.

II. INVOLVED PARTIES

Involved Officer #1:	Tartane Hutchinson, Star# 5629, Employee# ██████████ DOA March 25, 2002, Police Officer, Unit 011, DOB ██████████, 1976, Male, African American
Involved Individual #1:	██████████, 1985, Female, African American
Involved Individual #2:	CFD ██████████, 1962, Male, African American
Involved Individual #3	██████████ 1988, Female, African American

III. ALLEGATIONS

Officer	Allegation	Finding / Recommendation
Officer Hutchinson	1. ██████████ alleged that on or about December 5, 2014, at or near ██████████ ██████████ located in Gurnee, IL, the accused verbally abused Mrs. ██████████ in that he called her a whore and a slut in violation of Rule 9.	Sustained

	<p>2. [REDACTED] alleged that on or about the December 5, 2014, at or near [REDACTED] [REDACTED] located in Gurnee, IL, the accused threatened Mrs. [REDACTED] with bodily harm in violation of Rule 9.</p> <p>3. [REDACTED] alleged that on or about the December 5, 2014, at or near [REDACTED] [REDACTED] located in Gurnee, IL, the accused grabbed Mrs. [REDACTED] about the body in violation of Rule 9.</p> <p>4. [REDACTED] alleged that on or about December 5, 2014, at or near [REDACTED] [REDACTED] located in Gurnee, IL, the accused slammed Mrs. [REDACTED] to the ground in violation of Rule 9.</p> <p>5. [REDACTED] alleged that on or about December 5, 2014, at or near [REDACTED] [REDACTED] located in Gurnee, IL, the accused punched Mrs. [REDACTED] about the head in violation of Rule 9.</p> <p>6. [REDACTED] alleged that on or about December 5, 2014, at or near [REDACTED] [REDACTED] located in Gurnee, IL, the accused covered Mrs. [REDACTED] face with a pillow in violation of Rules 2 and 9.</p> <p>7. [REDACTED] alleged that on or about May 8, 2015, at or near [REDACTED] [REDACTED] Chicago, IL, the accused pushed Mrs. [REDACTED] about the body in violation of Rule 9.</p> <p>8. [REDACTED] alleged that on or about May 8, 2015, at or near [REDACTED] [REDACTED] Chicago, IL, the accused bent Mrs. [REDACTED] thumb back in violation of Rule 9.</p> <p>9. [REDACTED] alleged that on or about June 29, 2016, at or near [REDACTED] [REDACTED] Chicago IL, the accused</p>	<p>Sustained</p> <p>Sustained</p> <p>Sustained</p> <p>Sustained</p> <p>Sustained</p> <p>Sustained</p> <p>Sustained</p> <p>Sustained</p> <p>Sustained</p>
--	---	--

	grabbed Mrs. [REDACTED] about the body in violation of Rule 9.	
10.	[REDACTED] alleged that on or about June 29, 2016, at or near [REDACTED] Chicago IL, the accused slammed Mrs. [REDACTED] to the floor and/or bed in violation of Rule 9.	Sustained
11.	[REDACTED] alleged that on or about December 31, 2016, at or near [REDACTED] Chicago, IL , the accused strangled Mrs. [REDACTED] in violation of Rules 2 and 9.	Sustained
12.	[REDACTED] alleged that on or about December 31, 2016, at or near [REDACTED] Chicago, IL, the accused pushed and/or grabbed Mrs. [REDACTED] her about the body in violation of Rule 9.	Sustained
13.	[REDACTED] [REDACTED] alleged that on or about an unknown date in December 2016, at or near [REDACTED] Chicago, IL, the accused took Mrs. [REDACTED] keys and refused to return them in violation of Rules 2 and 8.	Sustained
14.	[REDACTED] alleged that on or about an unknown date in December 2016, in the vicinity of [REDACTED] the accused operated a motor vehicle while Mrs. [REDACTED] was holding onto the vehicle, thereby endangering her safety in violation of Rules 2 and 8.	Sustained
15.	[REDACTED] alleged that on or about December 11, 2017, at or near [REDACTED] Chicago, IL, the accused threatened to cause bodily harm to Mrs. [REDACTED] in violation of Rule 9.	Sustained
16.	[REDACTED] alleged that on or about December 12, 2017, at or near [REDACTED] Chicago, IL, the accused shoved Mrs. [REDACTED] in violation of Rule 9.	Sustained

IV. APPLICABLE RULES AND LAWS

Rules

1. Rule 2 – Any action or conduct which impedes the Department’s efforts to achieve its policy and goals or beings discredit upon the Department.
 2. Rule 8 – Disrespect to or maltreatment of any person, while on or off duty.
 3. Rule 9 – Engaging in any unjustified verbal or physical altercation with any person, while on or off duty.
-

V. INVESTIGATION¹

a. Interviews

In his **Initiation Report**,² Sgt. Richard Steinbrenner related that on January 27, 2018, the victim, ██████ came to the 006th District Station and reported that on December 13, 2017, during a domestic dispute, her ██████ Officer Hutchinson, threatened her. Mrs. ██████ stated that Officer Hutchinson stated words to the effect of, “I will fuck you up!” Mrs. ██████ stated that she did not immediately report the incident because she was scared, because he is a police officer.

In her statement³ to COPA on February 1, 2018, ██████ related that she and Officer Hutchinson were ██████ in December 2015, and they have an ██████. Mrs. ██████ related that she and Officer Hutchinson had a volatile relationship prior to December 2017. She related that she called the police once and hung up before requesting police service because she did not want to jeopardize his career by reporting him.

Mrs. ██████ related that she was a stay-at-home mom but had recently obtained employment which angered Officer Hutchinson. Although Officer Hutchinson was financially providing for the family, he would not fulfill his financial obligations when they had a disagreement. She also reported that he would often take her keys and refuse to return them, causing her to be unable to leave the home. On one occasion, she recalled Officer Hutchinson grabbing her by the collar and forcing her out of the house. She stated that the domestic incidents became physical in 2009, after she had their first child.

In May 2015 they got into a verbal altercation about someone Officer Hutchinson was texting. Officer Hutchinson pushed Mrs. ██████ on the bed, and she grabbed hold of him and would not let go. Officer Hutchinson then bent her thumb backwards. Mrs. ██████ stated she transported herself to ██████ Hospital and sought treatment. She admitted that she lied to hospital staff and reported that she sustained the injury while fighting with a friend.

¹ COPA conducted a thorough and complete investigation. The following is a summary of the material evidence gathered and relied upon in our analysis.

² Att. 5

³ Att. 8, 36

Mrs. █████ related that on June 29, 2016, she and Officer Hutchinson were in an altercation regarding text messages he received from another woman and Mrs. █████ wanted to leave the home. Officer Hutchinson grabbed Mrs. █████ and slammed her on the bed. Mrs. █████ screamed and tried to get Officer Hutchinson off her. Officer Hutchinson took her keys and refused to return them. In turn, Mrs. █████ took his cellphone and went on the back porch. When she returned and they exchanged property, Officer Hutchinson asked her for the SIM card that was in the cellphone. Officer Hutchinson tried to take Mrs. █████ purse. Officer Hutchinson grabbed Mrs. █████ and tried to slam her down but she did not fall to the floor. The couple continued to “tussle”⁴ until Officer Hutchinson lifted Mrs. █████ off her feet and slammed her down. She instantly felt a sharp pain in her ankle. Mrs. █████ tried to leave the home with █████, but Officer Hutchinson would not allow her to, so she went to sleep in the room with █████. Around 3:00 or 4:00 AM, she began experiencing excruciating pain and could not walk. Officer Hutchinson took her to █████ Hospital. Mrs. █████ told the emergency room staff that she stepped off the curb and hurt her leg. Mrs. █████ explained that she lied because she was still in love with Officer Hutchinson. Mr. █████ was given soft cast for her injury but eventually had got a hard cast.

Mrs. █████ also described an incident that occurred on December 4, 2016, at █████. Mrs. █████ stated that they went to the indoor amusement park to celebrate their █████ birthday. Officer Hutchinson accused her of cheating on him with her pastor and called her a “whore” and a “slut.”⁵ Mrs. █████ told her best friend, █████⁶ to go downstairs and she would meet her there. After Ms. █████ left, Officer Hutchinson stated, “I should fuck you up.”⁷ Officer Hutchinson grabbed and pushed Mrs. █████. He then told her that he was taking his █████ and leaving. When he left the hotel room, Mrs. █████ chased behind him. At which time, he slammed her down on the ground and dragged her in the hallway. Officer Hutchinson continued to threaten her and call her names. He then went downstairs. Mrs. █████ waited for a minute and allowed herself to regain her composure before she joined.

Later, when she and Ms. █████ were in the Lazy River, Officer Hutchinson yelled to her, “I should throw this motherfucking chair at you, you stupid bitch.”⁸ Mrs. █████ stated that there were lot of people around that heard him. Officer Hutchinson then took their █████ upstairs. Mrs. █████ and her █████, along with Ms. █████ proceeded upstairs to their hotel room to sing happy birthday to her █████. Officer Hutchinson called Mrs. █████ to the room. Once inside, Officer Hutchinson locked the door and turned the radio on. He led her to the bathroom and began to repeatedly punch her on the head and face. Mrs. █████ stated that she began crying and shaking uncontrollably. When Officer Hutchinson noticed her shaking, he tossed her in the tub, threw cold water on her and begged her not to die. Officer Hutchinson then stormed out. Ms. █████ entered the bathroom, observed Mrs. █████ on the floor and helped her up. Ms. █████ was scared and left with her █████ after asking Mrs. █████ if she wanted her to stay. Mrs. █████ stated that she pulled herself together and continued celebrating her █████ birthday. When Officer Hutchinson returned, he tortured her all night long. He repeatedly grabbed her and put a pillow on her face. Mrs. █████ stated that Officer Hutchinson had done this in the past. The

⁴ Att. 36 at 64.

⁵ Id. at 53.

⁶ COPA attempted to contact Ms. █████ but was unable to obtain a statement from her.

⁷ Att. 36 at 53.

⁸ Id. at 54.

first time he placed a pillow over her face he told her that he could kill her, and no one would know. Mrs. █████ stated that █████ heard them arguing. Mrs. █████ believed she sustained bruising as a result of the incident.

Mrs. █████ recalled another incident in December 2016 when Officer Hutchinson took her keys and left the house. She followed him outside to try to retrieve the keys, because she had no way to lock the house. Mrs. █████ recalled her next-door neighbor was outside taking down his holiday decorations. Officer Hutchinson entered his vehicle, and Mrs. █████ grabbed the door. She told him that he was not going anywhere and demanded that he return her keys. Mrs. █████ yelled out to the neighbor and asked him to call the police. As Mrs. █████ was standing on the “rail”⁹ of the vehicle and holding the handle, Officer Hutchinson “pulled off fast.”¹⁰ Mrs. █████ continued to hold on, afraid to let car. She stated that Officer Hutchinson drove fast around the entire block and failed to stop at any stop signs. Mrs. █████ was not injured.

On December 31, 2016, Mrs. █████ went downstairs to talk to Officer Hutchinson who had been sleeping in the basement for a few days. Officer Hutchinson did not want to talk, but Mrs. █████ turned on the lights and demanded that he speak with her. Officer Hutchinson told her to get out of the way because she was blocking the stairwell. He then grabbed Mrs. █████ slammed her against the wall and started choking her. He then pushed her, causing her face to strike the game table and caused a laceration to her lip. He then stated to her, “This is what you like.”¹¹ Mrs. █████ ran away, and he chased her. She threw an unknown object in Officer Hutchinson’s direction and ran upstairs to her █████ bedroom. Mrs. █████ did not call the police, nor did she seek medical attention. Mrs. █████ sustained bruises to her neck and face and a lacerated lip. She took photographs of her injuries and submitted the photos to COPA.¹²

Furthermore, Mrs. █████ reported that on December 11, 2017, after she yelled at their █████ for “lagging”¹³ while getting ready for school, Officer Hutchinson told her not to talk to their █████ in that manner and threatened to “fuck [her] up” and “drag [her] ass.”¹⁴ As their █████ and Officer Hutchinson were leaving the home, she told her █████ to put on his eyeglasses. Officer Hutchinson told her that he did not have to wear his glasses. Mrs. █████ quickly closed the door behind them. After Mrs. █████ and her █████ left the home, she noticed that her █████ who was in the backseat of Officer Hutchinson’s vehicle, was still not wearing his glasses. She exited her vehicle, tapped on Officer Hutchinson’s rear window, and told her █████ to put his glasses on. Officer Hutchinson reminded her that they had court, and as he pulled off, she called him a “son of a bitch.”¹⁵ After their court date, she admitted that she confronted Officer Hutchinson and asked him why he was trying to make her the enemy and told him that karma is a bitch, and his life is going to be a living hell. She stated at no time did she hit or threaten Officer Hutchinson.

On December 12, 2017, she and Officer Hutchinson had a verbal altercation regarding their █████ cellphone. She explained that Officer Hutchinson was standing in the doorway and yelling

⁹ Id. at 35.

¹⁰ Id.

¹¹ Id. at 39.

¹² Att. 11.

¹³ Att. 36 at 9.

¹⁴ Id.

¹⁵ Id. at 14.

at her. She pulled Officer Hutchinson closer to her, at which time, he shoved her into the hallway. Mrs. [REDACTED] then told him to get the hell out of the house and forced him out of the door. Mrs. [REDACTED] stated that following that incident, she had minimum contact with Officer Hutchinson because he had started avoiding her by not answering her calls and not coming home. Mrs. [REDACTED] stated that she later found out that Officer Hutchinson obtained an Order of Protection against her restricting her from contacting him and their children. Officer Hutchinson accused her of striking him on the left side of the face and closed his foot in the door as he was leaving. He also accused her of stating words to the effect of, "You are an enemy. I am going to make your life a living hell."

In a statement to COPA on June 28, 2018, [REDACTED]¹⁶ an active Chicago Firefighter, related that he is the next-door neighbor of [REDACTED] and Officer Hutchinson and has been living on the block for approximately three years. He stated that the couple had been over to his home twice. Mr. [REDACTED] stated that the houses are small and close together and he sometimes he heard the couple arguing. He added that he would mainly hear Mrs. [REDACTED] voice. Mr. [REDACTED] recalled one incident when he was outside putting up Christmas lights and observed both Mrs. [REDACTED] and Officer Hutchinson run out of the house. Mrs. [REDACTED] was wearing a robe and house slippers. Officer Hutchinson jumped in the car and Mrs. [REDACTED] grabbed onto the car and was yelling for Officer Hutchinson to return her keys. The couple continued to argue, and Officer Hutchinson repeatedly told her to get off the car. Mr. [REDACTED] believed Officer Hutchinson was driving a brown Toyota Sequoia. Suddenly, Officer Hutchinson drove off with Mrs. [REDACTED] still affixed to the vehicle. Mr. [REDACTED] explained that Mrs. [REDACTED] was standing on the running board on the passenger's side of the vehicle and was holding onto the luggage rack on top of the vehicle. Mr. [REDACTED] stated that Officer Hutchinson was headed southbound and driving approximately 10 to 15 mph. Officer Hutchinson traveled to 82nd Street and made a left-hand turn. Mr. [REDACTED] stated that, in his opinion, Officer Hutchinson was driving too fast for anyone to safely jump off.

Approximately 10 to 15 minutes later, Officer Hutchinson returned home with Mrs. [REDACTED] still outside of the vehicle and holding on to the luggage rack. Mr. [REDACTED] assumed that Officer Hutchinson called his mother because she arrived on the scene. She instructed Mrs. [REDACTED] to return Officer Hutchinson's keys and get off the truck. Mrs. [REDACTED] told her to have Officer Hutchinson return her keys. Officer Hutchinson's mother told them that the neighbors were watching. Mrs. [REDACTED] stated that she did not care, and she wanted them to know. When Officer Hutchinson's mom retrieved the keys from Officer Hutchinson, Mrs. [REDACTED] got off the truck and she and Officer Hutchinson's mom went inside. Officer Hutchinson drove away. Mr. [REDACTED] stated that he continued to hear commotion coming from their home but assumed it was just Mrs. [REDACTED] yelling and breaking items inside of the home. When asked, Mr. [REDACTED] stated that he does not recall if Mrs. [REDACTED] asked him to call the police or not.

Mr. [REDACTED] stated that after the incident, Officer Hutchinson's mom approached him and gave him her telephone number. She instructed Mr. [REDACTED] to give her a call if he hears anything or if something happens so she could come over and "do whatever she needed to do and keep him out of trouble or whatever."¹⁷ Mr. [REDACTED] stated that he had never met Officer Hutchinson's mom prior to the date of this incident. Mr. [REDACTED] stated that he did use her

¹⁶ Att. 27, 35

¹⁷ Att. 35 at 19

number once when he heard them arguing inside of the house. Mr. ██████ stated that he has never heard or observed any physical abuse between Officer Hutchinson and Mrs. ██████. He did recall seeing a cast on Mrs. ██████ leg but did not know how she sustained the injury. Mr. ██████ described Mrs. ██████ as normally keeping to herself.

Mr. ██████ stated that Mrs. ██████ no longer lives at the ██████ home, and he has not seen her since the police responded to the home when she tried to retrieve some of her belongings. Mr. ██████ related that he called Mrs. ██████ while she was work and informed her that the locks were being changed at the house. Upon inquiry, Mr. ██████ stated that while he never addressed Officer Hutchinson about the car incident, he did have a conversation with him regarding his job. Mr. ██████ told Officer Hutchinson that when you work for the fire department, police, or sheriff's office, you can't get caught up in certain things because you can get in trouble. He told Officer Hutchinson that he needed his job to support his ██████ and if the relationship was not working, they should part ways. Mr. ██████ identified his ██████ as a witness to the interactions between Officer Hutchinson and Mrs. ██████.

In a statement to COPA on June 29, 2018, ██████ related that she resided with her parents off and on between summer of 2015 and early 2017. Ms. ██████ explained that she had her ██████ in May 2016 and was bedridden during her pregnancy, which was the reason she returned home. Ms. ██████ stated that she would see Mrs. ██████ with her children in passing and would speak to her. Ms. ██████ stated that she initially thought that Officer Hutchinson was a nice guy, but her opinion of him changed when she discovered how he treated Mrs. ██████. On a few occasions she caught him being physically abusive to Mrs. ██████. Ms. ██████ recalled an incident in which the couple was returning home and were in the garage. She observed Officer Hutchinson push Mrs. ██████ and she fell. Mrs. ██████ jumped up and shouted to him, "Why did you do that?" Officer Hutchinson stated that Mrs. ██████ fell and asked Mrs. ██████ "Didn't you fall?" Mrs. ██████ confirmed that she fell and that she was okay. Ms. ██████ noticed that she was limping. Ms. ██████ explained that she had an unobstructed view of the Hutchinson's garage because, at the time, they did not have a fence separating their backyards. Ms. ██████ stated that she later told her dad what she observed. Ms. ██████ did not know the exact date of the incident but stated that it was fall of 2015. Ms. ██████ added that as time progressed, Mrs. ██████ confided in her and told her that Officer Hutchinson had pushed her.

Ms. ██████ recalled the second incident in which she observed Officer Hutchinson demonstrate abusive behavior towards Mrs. ██████. She remembered that she heard them argue in the house. She called her father and told them that they were arguing bad. Although her father told her not to worry about it and stay in the house, Ms. ██████ couldn't help but worry. At the time, Mrs. ██████ had a broken foot and was wearing a boot. Ms. ██████ went outside and to the rear of her home as if she was taking out the garbage. Ms. ██████ observed the couple coming out the back door arguing over Mrs. ██████ keys. Mrs. ██████ was pleading with Officer Hutchinson to return her keys. He told her that she was going to make a scene, to get the "f" back in the house, and don't make him hurt her.¹⁹ Mrs. ██████ reached for her keys and Officer Hutchinson slammed the door on her arm. Ms. ██████ heard Mrs. ██████ scream and Officer Hutchinson

¹⁸ Att. 33, 34

¹⁹ Att. 34 at 18.

stated words to the effect of, “Yeah, that’s what you get.”²⁰ Ms. ██████ called her dad and gave him an update, and after seeing Officer Hutchinson pull off, she went to Mrs. ██████ home to check on her. Ms. ██████ knocked on the door, but when no one responded, she began to walk away. Mrs. ██████ then peeked out of the door, and Ms. ██████ returned and asked her to open the door for her. Mrs. ██████ confided in Ms. ██████ and told her that everybody thinks that Officer Hutchinson is a perfect man and he’s not. She instructed Ms. ██████ to help her if she if she ever heard her screaming. She also told Mrs. ██████ that Officer Hutchinson broke her ankle during a previous incident. Mrs. ██████ told Mrs. ██████ that if she ever needed her, just knock on her door.

Ms. ██████ stated that she didn’t see Mrs. ██████ again until a week after Ms. ██████ delivered her baby. Ms. ██████ stated that she saw Mrs. ██████ wearing a boot on the same ankle that she had injured in the past. Mrs. ██████ congratulated her on the delivery of her ██████. Ms. ██████ stated later that day she talked to Mrs. ██████ on her front porch. She noticed that Mrs. ██████ had lost an extreme amount of weight. Mrs. ██████ began telling her how Officer Hutchinson treated her and how he broke her ankle by trying to pull her out of the bed. As she and Mrs. ██████ were talking, Officer Hutchinson pulled up. As he approached the ladies, he asked Mrs. ██████ how she was doing, and she replied, “Fuck you.”

Ms. ██████ stated that after that day, Mrs. ██████ would speak to her but not engage in conversation. In the spring or summer of 2016, she spoke to Mrs. ██████ as she was entering the house. She observed Officer Hutchinson with his hand raised and then he closed the door. Ms. ██████ stated that their windows were open, and she heard a sound that sounded like a slap and then something or someone fell to the floor. She then heard the couple arguing. Ms. ██████ immediately called her dad, and her dad told her to call the police, but she did not. Ms. ██████ stated that she instantly grew mad with Mrs. ██████ because she felt like Mrs. ██████ had become distant with her. She felt that if Mrs. ██████ didn’t want to put up with the abuse, then she should just leave.

Ms. ██████ recalled one day when her father called her downstairs and told her to look out the window. Ms. ██████ observed Mrs. ██████ on the hood of the car and screaming for Officer Hutchinson to return her keys. Mrs. ██████ was wearing a lounge coat with shorts underneath. Officer Hutchinson, who was inside of his vehicle, was yelling for her to get off the car. Officer Hutchinson began backing out of his parking space. Mrs. ██████ continued screaming for her keys and told him that she didn’t care if everyone came outside to see that he beats her. Officer Hutchinson pulled off and drove to the corner of the block with Ms. ██████ on the hood and holding on to top of the hood near the gap (cowl). She stated that Mrs. ██████ stated, “Kill me. I’m tired.”²¹ Mrs. ██████ related that her neighbors across the street were outside and witnessed the incident. Mrs. ██████ observed Mrs. ██████ walking back inside of the house but she did not see Officer Hutchinson. Ms. ██████ stated that this was a different incident than her father witnessed. She stated that Officer Hutchinson always took Mrs. ██████ keys from her.

Ms. ██████ related that one time Officer Hutchinson spoke to her and one of her friends who was sitting on her front porch. Ms. ██████ instructed her friend not to talk to him.

²⁰ Id. at 19.

²¹ Id. at 41.

Officer Hutchinson told Ms. [REDACTED] that there's a lot going on and said that Mrs. [REDACTED] was crazy and unstable. Mrs. [REDACTED] responded, "Certain things just should not happen."²²

Ms. [REDACTED] related that she is still in contact with Mrs. [REDACTED] although she no longer lives with Officer Hutchinson. Mrs. [REDACTED] confided in Ms. [REDACTED] and told her that Officer Hutchinson beat her for talking to her and sharing their business.

In a statement to COPA on September 21, 2021, **Officer Tartane Hutchinson**²³ stated that he met his [REDACTED] in 2008, [REDACTED] in 2015, and [REDACTED] in 2018. The couple have [REDACTED]. Officer Hutchinson stated that his [REDACTED] with Mrs. [REDACTED] didn't work out and shortly after they got [REDACTED] they started arguing a lot. Mrs. [REDACTED] changed in that she became more argumentative and disagreeable. The couple went to counseling in 2016 but were not able to salvage the [REDACTED]. Officer Hutchinson stated that he wanted her to finish school, but Mrs. [REDACTED] obtained a job. He did not know where she was employed at the time. Officer Hutchinson stated that he has never had a physical altercation with Mrs. [REDACTED]. Although he was aware that she sustained an injury to her thumb and a broken ankle, he did not recall how she sustained the injuries and did not recall taking her to the hospital for treatment for said injuries. Officer Hutchinson recalled Mrs. [REDACTED] wearing a splint in 2015 but did not recall how she sustained the injury. He also did not recall if Mrs. [REDACTED] had crutches.

Officer Hutchinson stated that he, Mrs. [REDACTED] and one of her friends went to [REDACTED] to celebrate their [REDACTED] birthday. He recalled having a verbal dispute with Mrs. [REDACTED] over their telephones but did not recall the specifics of the argument and denied that the altercation turned physical.

Officer Hutchinson stated that he filed a police report ([REDACTED] and an Order of Protection against Mrs. [REDACTED] when she got physical with him after he [REDACTED]. Officer Hutchinson stated that she pushed the entry door on his foot when he was leaving the house and punched him on the left side of the face. Officer Hutchinson stated that he also filed RD# [REDACTED] after he observed several of his weapons, a watch case with several watches and miscellaneous documents were missing after Mrs. [REDACTED] was seen removing items from the residence.

Officer Hutchinson also filed [REDACTED] naming Mrs. [REDACTED] as the offender after she came to his job to speak to him in violation of the Order of Protection that he filed prohibiting her from contacting him.

Officer Hutchinson stated that in 2016, he owned a gray 2002 Lexus LS300 (sedan), a tan/gold 2000 Lexus LX47 SUV, and a 2011 GMC Acadia. With respect to the December 2016 incident, Officer Hutchinson related that he parked in front of his house, and when he pulled off, Mrs. [REDACTED] jumped on the truck while the car was in motion. Officer Hutchinson stated that he was not traveling at a high speed because he had just pulled off. He immediately pulled over when he noticed her on the passenger side of his vehicle. He stated that he did not know what part of the car Mrs. [REDACTED] was holding on to. Officer Hutchinson did not recall many details about the incident. He did not recall if Mrs. [REDACTED] was wearing a robe at the time nor did he recall his mother being on

²² Id. at 45.

²³ Att. 46-48

the scene. Officer Hutchinson stated he does not recall what happened after he stopped driving and pulled to the curb. Officer Hutchinson stated that his car traveled from in front of his house to his next-door neighbor's house. He stated that he did not drive to the corner of his block while Mrs. ██████ was on his vehicle. Officer Hutchinson stated that he has never taken Mrs. ██████ keys from her and there has never been an incident between the two of them that required his mother or any neighbor to intervene.

b. Digital Evidence

Mrs. ██████ submitted **photos**²⁴ that she took of herself on December 31, 2016. The photos depict what appears to be a cut on the bottom right side of her lip and redness and bruising on her neck. Mrs. ██████ submitted photos depicting bruises on her neck and arm, and a large bruise on her right buttock that she sustained on unknown dates. Mrs. ██████ also submitted several photos²⁵ of the injuries from November 2014 when Officer Hutchinson restrained her from leaving the bedroom, took her keys, grabbed her, choked her and pushed her against the wall.

c. Physical Evidence

According to ██████ **Hospital Records**²⁶ on May 8, 2015, at approximately 2042 hours, Mrs. ██████ sought treatment at the Emergency Room. Mrs. ██████ who was 16 weeks pregnant at the time, complained of pain to her left hand and stated that she struck someone on the head with an open fist 2 hours prior to her ER visit. Xray showed signs of possible fracture fragments, but Mrs. ██████ did not have pain in that area. Mrs. ██████ was diagnosed with left thumb sprain, which required a thumb splint, and a left-hand contusion. On June 30, 2016 at 0732 hours, Mrs. ██████ returned to the emergency room and complained of pain to her right ankle. Mrs. ██████ told hospital staff that she hurt her ankle after stepping off a curb. Swelling and deformity were observed. Mrs. ██████ was diagnosed with a Right Distal Fibula Nondisplaced Fracture. A posterior mold was applied to her right ankle and crutches were provided.

d. Documentary Evidence

Officer Hutchinson petitioned the Cook County Circuit Court for an **Order of Protection**²⁷ on December 18, 2017. In the Petition, Officer Hutchinson reported that, on December 11, 2017, in response to him ██████, Mrs. ██████ struck him on the left side of his face, kicked his car, and closed his foot in the door. The following day, Mrs. ██████ stated words to the effect of, "I'm going to make your life a living hell." An Emergency Order of Protection, Case No. 17D ██████, was granted restricting Mrs. ██████ from contacting Officer Hutchinson and their children.

Domestic Battery Case report ██████ was filed by Officer Hutchinson on December 16, 2017. Officer Hutchinson reported that five days prior, Mrs. ██████ closed the house door on his

²⁴ Att. 11

²⁵ COPA attempted to contact Mrs. ██████ for additional information regarding the incident. The allegations were not addressed in her initial COPA interview. Thus, the allegations were not given to Officer Hutchinson or addressed in this investigation.

²⁶ Att. 15

²⁷ Att. 12

²⁸ Att. 16, 17

foot and punched him on the left side of his face and yelled at him about taking her to court. The case was suspended after detectives were not able to reach Officer Hutchinson for follow-up investigation.²⁹

On Jan 27, 2018, Simple Assault Case report ██████████³⁰ was generated after Mrs. ██████████ related that on December 13, 2017, during a verbal altercation about their ██████████ Officer Hutchinson stated words to the effect of, “Don’t fucking talk to him like that ever again. I will fuck you up.” Mrs. ██████████ added that she did not report the incident at the time because she was scared due to the fact that he is a Chicago Police Officer and on prior occasions, she had not received adequate assistance from the Department.

VI. LEGAL STANDARD

For each Allegation COPA must make one of the following findings:

1. Sustained - where it is determined the allegation is supported by a preponderance of the evidence;
2. Not Sustained - where it is determined there is insufficient evidence to prove the allegations by a preponderance of the evidence;
3. Unfounded - where it is determined by clear and convincing evidence that an allegation is false or not factual; or
4. Exonerated - where it is determined by clear and convincing evidence that the conduct described in the allegation occurred, but it is lawful and proper.

A **preponderance of evidence** can be described as evidence indicating that it is **more likely than not** that the conduct reviewed complied with Department policy. *See Avery v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co.*, 216 Ill. 2d 100, 191 (2005), (a proposition is proved by a preponderance of the evidence when it has found to be more probably true than not). If the evidence gathered in an investigation establishes that it is more likely that the conduct complied with Department policy than that it did not, even if by a narrow margin, then the preponderance of the evidence standard is met.

Clear and convincing evidence is a higher standard than a preponderance of the evidence but lower than the "beyond-a-reasonable doubt" standard required to convict a person of a criminal offense. *See e.g., People v. Coan*, 2016 IL App (2d) 151036 (2016). Clear and Convincing can be defined as a “degree of proof, which, considering all the evidence in the case, produces the firm and abiding belief that it is highly probable that the proposition . . . is true.” *Id.* at ¶ 28.

²⁹ Officer Hutchinson filed other police reports against Mrs. ██████████. However, these reports were not related to the allegations addressed in this report. *See* Att. 42, 20, 22, 18, 19

³⁰ Att. 13, 14

VII. ANALYSIS**a. Credibility Assessment**

Preliminarily, COPA recognizes that domestic violence differs in many ways from other allegations of misconduct. Primarily, domestic violence often occurs in private and often leaves the investigator without the benefit certain types of evidence such as eyewitness accounts and direct video evidence capturing the incidents under investigation. Furthermore, the unique dynamics of power and control that exist within domestic violence relationships often cause victims to hide the violence they are experiencing and delay their reporting for a myriad of reasons including, but not limited to, fear of the abuser, lack of resources, financial dependency, concerns for children in the household, and fear of retaliation. Thus, findings in these cases often depend on limited objective evidence and credibility determinations.

The credibility of an individual relies primarily on two factors: 1) the individual's truthfulness and 2) the reliability of the individual's account. The first factor addresses the honesty of the individual making the statement, while the second factor speaks to the individual's ability to accurately perceive the event at the time of the incident and then accurately recall the event from memory. In this case, Officer Hutchinson's account is so divergent from Mrs. [REDACTED] account that the variances can only be explained by either Mrs. [REDACTED] or Officer Hutchinson misrepresenting or minimizing the facts of the incidents.

In this case, COPA finds Mrs. [REDACTED] account more credible than Officer Hutchinson's. Mrs. [REDACTED] allegation of repeated physical abuse over several years is corroborated by independent witnesses and evidence. First, although Ms. [REDACTED] was not a witness to many of the specific allegations served in this case, she stated that she observed multiple incidents of physical abuse perpetrated by Officer Hutchinson against Ms. [REDACTED] over time. Additionally, Mr. [REDACTED] was a direct witness to the December 2016 incident in which Officer Hutchinson drove his vehicle while Mrs. [REDACTED] was holding on and corroborated her version of events. Both Mr. and Ms. [REDACTED] were neighbors of Officer Hutchinson and Mrs. [REDACTED]. Neither have any apparent motivation to support Mrs. [REDACTED] accounts of abuse over Officer Hutchinson's nor do they have any apparent bias or motive to lie. Furthermore, Mrs. [REDACTED] provided photographs documenting injuries from Officer Hutchinson's physical abuse over the years, some of which related to specific allegations served in this case. Lastly, medical records corroborate some of Mrs. [REDACTED] injuries.

COPA does not find Officer Hutchinson's account credible. Officer Hutchinson denied ever physically abusing Mrs. [REDACTED] which was directly contradicted by Ms. [REDACTED]. He further minimized and denied the December 2016 incident in which he drove his vehicle while Mrs. [REDACTED] was holding on, which was directly contradicted by Mr. [REDACTED]. Moreover, he denied knowing the cause of significant injuries Mrs. [REDACTED] sustained or seeing her with crutches, an account that is improbable given the severity of the injuries and the fact that he was her [REDACTED] at the time the injuries occurred. Overall, the evidence does not support his denial of the allegations against him.

Thus, for the reasons stated above, COPA finds Mrs. [REDACTED] more credible than Officer Hutchinson.

b. **Allegation Analysis**

COPA finds that **Allegations 1-6** that on or about December 5, 2014 Officer Hutchinson called Mrs. [REDACTED] a whore and a slut, threatened her with bodily harm, grabbed her about the body, slammed her to the ground, punched her about the head, and covered her face with a pillow are **Sustained**. While Officer Hutchinson denied that this incident was physical, he admitted that there was an argument. As previously stated, COPA finds Mrs. [REDACTED] account credible. Mrs. [REDACTED] provided a thorough and detailed account of this incident. She described verbal abuse and threats that occurred throughout the day, which ultimately escalated to physical abuse. She also described the manner in which she attempted to hide the verbal and physical abuse from friends and children who were present. Thus, COPA finds these allegations are more likely than not to have occurred as alleged.

Similarly, COPA finds **Allegations 7 and 8** that on or about May 8, 2015, Officer Hutchinson pushed Mrs. [REDACTED] about the body and bent her thumb back are **Sustained**. Again, COPA finds Mrs. [REDACTED] more credible. Mrs. [REDACTED] account is further corroborated by medical records that document the injury she sustained to her thumb. Mrs. [REDACTED] admitted that she did not provide medical personnel with a true account of how she sustained the injuries. COPA does not find that this diminishes her credibility, since she freely admitted this to COPA. Further, it is not uncommon for domestic violence victims to give false accounts to medical personnel regarding the origin of their injuries. Officer Hutchinson recalled the injury but denied causing it himself or knowing how it was caused, which COPA does not find credible. Thus, COPA finds these allegations are more likely than not to have occurred as alleged.

COPA finds that **Allegations 9 and 10** that on or about June 29, 2016, Officer Hutchinson grabbed Mrs. [REDACTED] and slammed her on the bed and/or floor are **Sustained**. Mrs. [REDACTED] reported that she sustained a broken leg as a result of the incident. She related that Officer Hutchinson took her to the hospital, but instead of telling the hospital staff what occurred, she told hospital staff that she injured herself when she stepped off a curb. She admitted to COPA that she did not report Officer Hutchinson because she still loved him and wanted to be with him. Mrs. [REDACTED] confided in Ms. [REDACTED] regarding the incident. Ms. [REDACTED] account of the incident corroborates what Mrs. Hutchinson reported to COPA. Medical records from [REDACTED] Hospital confirm that Mrs. [REDACTED] sustained a broken right ankle and was provided crutches for walking assistance. During his statement to COPA, Officer Hutchinson denied the allegations, and while admitting that he was still living in the [REDACTED] residence at the time, he vaguely recalled Mrs. [REDACTED] having a broken ankle. However, he denied knowing how she sustained the injury, which COPA does not find credible. Thus, COPA finds these allegations are sustained by a preponderance of the evidence.

COPA finds **Allegations 11 and 12** that on or about December 31, 2016, Officer Hutchinson strangled Mrs. [REDACTED] and pushed and/or grabbed her about the body are **Sustained**. Mrs. [REDACTED] related that on this date, Officer Hutchinson grabbed her, slammed her against the wall and started choking her. He then pushed her, causing her face to strike the game table and causing a laceration to her lip. Mrs. [REDACTED] provided photographs to COPA which document the injuries she sustained as a result of this incident: a laceration to her lip and bruising and scratches to her neck.

Officer Hutchinson denied the allegations. As stated, COPA does not find the accused credible. Thus, the allegations are Sustained.

COPA finds that **Allegations #13 and 14** that on an unknown date in December 2016, Officer Hutchinson took Mrs. [REDACTED] keys and refused to return them and operated a motor vehicle while she was holding onto the vehicle, thereby endangering her safety are **Sustained**. Mrs. [REDACTED] stated she chased Officer Hutchinson out of the house while wearing loungewear, to retrieve the keys that he took from her. While she was asking for her keys, Officer Hutchinson sped off with her still holding onto to the vehicle. Mr. [REDACTED] corroborated Mrs. [REDACTED] account. Mr. [REDACTED] heard Mrs. [REDACTED] asking him to return her keys. He then observed Officer Hutchinson pull off while Mrs. [REDACTED] was still standing on the vehicle's running board. He stated that Officer Hutchinson was traveling approximately 10 to 15 mph and too fast for anyone to safely jump from the car. Mr. [REDACTED] stated that he was afraid for Mrs. [REDACTED] safety and was relieved when Officer Hutchinson returned home approximately 10 or 15 minutes later with Mrs. [REDACTED] still on the running board. Officer Hutchinson admitted Mrs. [REDACTED] jumped on the passenger side of his SUV as he was pulling off. However, he related that he immediately pulled over to the curb when he observed her. Officer Hutchinson stated that he was not traveling fast and did not travel far, possibly just from the front of his house to his next-door neighbor's home and never made it to the corner of his residential block. Officer Hutchinson's account was directly refuted by Mr. [REDACTED]. Thus, COPA finds these allegations are Sustained.

Lastly, COPA finds **Allegations 15 and 16** that on or about December 11th and December 12th, 2017, Officer Hutchinson threatened to cause bodily harm to Mrs. [REDACTED] and shoved her are **Sustained**. Again, COPA finds Mrs. [REDACTED] credible. Mrs. [REDACTED] provided a detailed account of the incidents. She was also honest about her actions and words during these incidents, further demonstrating her credibility. COPA does not find Officer Hutchinson's petition for an Order of Protection or police report outweigh Mrs. [REDACTED] credibility. Thus, COPA finds these allegations are Sustained.

VIII. RECOMMENDED DISCIPLINE FOR SUSTAINED ALLEGATIONS

a. Officer Tartane Hutchinson

i. Complimentary and Disciplinary History

1. **Complimentary:** 1 Problem Solving Award, 4 Attendance Awards, 1 Presidential Deployment Award, 5 Physical Fitness Awards, 3 Department Commendations, 1 Crime Reduction Ribbon (2004), 17 Honorable Mentions, 2 Crime Reduction Awards (2009 & 2019) 2 Complimentary Letters, 1 Life Saving Award, 1 NATA Summit Service Award, 2 Arnold Mireles Special Partner

ii. Recommended Penalty: Separation

Based on all of the evidence obtained in this investigation, COPA concluded that Officer Hutchinson was repeatedly verbally and physically abusive to Mrs. [REDACTED] over the course of several

years. Furthermore, more than one of the instances of physical abuse were extreme and seriously endangered Mrs. [REDACTED] life. Domestic violence is a serious violation of Department Rules and Regulations. This conduct significantly undermines the public's trust in the Department and is conduct unbecoming of any member of the Chicago Police Department, especially one trusted with enforcing the law and ensuring public safety. Thus, COPA recommends that Officer Hutchinson be separated from the Department.

Approved:

[REDACTED]

Sharday Jackson
Deputy Chief Administrator – Chief Investigator

October 31, 2022

Date

[REDACTED]

Andre Kersten
Chief Administrator

October 31, 2022

Date