

SUMMARY REPORT OF INVESTIGATION

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Date of Incident:	December 12, 2018
Time of Incident:	4:30 p.m.
Location of Incident:	[REDACTED]
Date of COPA Notification:	December 21, 2018
Time of COPA Notification:	12:22 p.m.

On December 12, 2018, a sergeant and several officers were dispatched to a domestic disturbance call involving Officer Zondranika Williams (Officer Williams) and [REDACTED] ([REDACTED]). When they arrived at the location, the screen door was locked. Officers attempted to knock on the door and windows but received no answer. Officers were finally able to make entry and once inside they spoke to Officer Williams and [REDACTED] about what occurred. Ultimately, [REDACTED] was arrested for domestic battery.

II. INVOLVED PARTIES

Involved Officer #1:	Zondranika Williams, Star# 16267, Emp.# [REDACTED], DOA: June 29, 2015, Officer, 001, [REDACTED], 1986, Female, Black
Involved Officer #2:	Alejandro Cabral, Star# 1286, Emp.# [REDACTED], DOA: September 25, 2006, Sergeant, 006, [REDACTED], 1978, Male, Hispanic
Involved Individual #1:	[REDACTED], [REDACTED], 1993, Female, Black

III. ALLEGATIONS

Officer	Allegation	Finding / Recommendation
Sergeant Alejandro Cabral	1. It is alleged by COPA by and through Deputy Chief Angela Hearts-Glass, that on or about December 12, 2018, at or after 5:30pm, at or near [REDACTED], Sgt. Alejandro Cabral, star 1286, committed misconduct through the following act or omission, by:	

	<p>1. failing to generate a log number for a domestic incident involving Officer Zondranika Williams and ██████████, in violation of rule 5.</p> <p>2. failing to properly notify COPA, for a domestic incident involving Officer Zondranika Williams and ██████████, as required, in violation of rule 5.</p> <p>3. failing to request an evidence technician for a domestic incident involving Officer Zondranika Williams and ██████████, in violation of rule 5</p> <p>4. failing to conduct a thorough investigation for a domestic incident involving Officer Zondranika Williams and ██████████, in violation of rule 5.</p>	<p>Sustained / Reprimand</p> <p>Sustained / Reprimand</p> <p>Not Sustained</p> <p>Not Sustained</p>
<p>Officer Zondranika Williams</p>	<p>It is alleged by ██████████ that on or about December 12, 2018, at approximately 4:30pm, at or near ██████████, Officer Zondranika Williams, star 16267, committed misconduct through the following act or omission, by:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. punching ██████████ in the nose, without justification, in violation of rule 9. 2. biting ██████████ on her hands, without justification, in violation of rule 9. 3. choking ██████████, without justification, in violation of rule 9. 4. engaging in an unjustified physical altercation with ██████████, in violation of rule 9. 5. engaging in an unjustified verbal altercation with ██████████, in violation of rule 9. 6. obstructing ██████████ from calling for emergency assistance by taking her phone, in violation of rule 9. 7. having ██████████ arrested, without justification, in violation of rule 2. 8. failing to properly secure your weapon, in violation of rule 13. 	<p>Sustained / 5-day Suspension</p> <p>Not Sustained</p> <p>Not Sustained</p> <p>Sustained / 5-day Suspension</p> <p>Sustained / 5-day Suspension</p> <p>Not Sustained</p> <p>Not Sustained</p> <p>Sustained / 5-day Suspension</p>

IV. APPLICABLE RULES AND LAWS

<p>Rules</p>

-
1. Rule 2- Any action or conduct which impedes the Department's efforts to achieve its policy and goals or brings discredit upon the Department.
 2. Rule 5- Failure to perform any duty.
 3. Rule 9-Engaging in any unjustified verbal or physical altercation with any person, while on or off duty.
 4. Rule 13- Failure adequately to secure and care for Department property.
-

General Orders

1. G04-04
-

Special Orders

1. U04-02
2. S04-04

V. INVESTIGATION¹

a. Interviews

██████████ was interviewed by COPA on December 21, 2018.² The incident occurred on December 12, 2018. According to ██████, Officer Zondranika Williams texted her on December 12, 2018, and asked ██████ to come over to her house. ██████ agreed and she arrived to Officer Williams' house at about 1pm. When ██████ arrived at Officer Williams' house, she went to her bedroom. Officer Williams received a phone call and she left the bedroom, shortly after she returned back to the bedroom. ██████ told Officer Williams that she did not have to leave the room to answer her phone. ██████ then received a phone call, but she did not answer the phone and she declined the call. Officer Williams asked ██████ who was calling. ██████ phone rang again and this time Officer Williams grabbed the phone and answered it. ██████ asked for her phone back and snatched her phone back from Officer Williams. Officer Williams told ██████ to get out of her house and that she was being disrespectful. ██████ told her that she did not come over to argue and that she would leave after she called her cousin. Officer Williams told her that she could call her cousin outside her house. Officer Williams sat on the bed and Officer Williams grabbed ██████ and ██████ hit Officer Williams toward her forehead in a playful manner.

Officer Williams tried to kiss ██████ and ██████ rejected her. Officer Williams told ██████ to get out of her house again. Officer Williams then grabbed ██████ by her arms and started pulling

¹ COPA conducted a thorough and complete investigation. The following is a summary of the material evidence gathered and relied upon in our analysis.

² Att. 14.

her toward the front door. █████ asked Officer Williams for a jersey back that she had brought. Officer Williams kept asking █████ to get out, but █████ told her to wait and that she needed to call her cousin. Officer Williams grabbed █████ by her coat and tried to drag her out of the house. █████ asked for the jersey again. Officer Williams told her that she was not getting the jersey back. █████ fell to the ground as Officer Williams was trying to drag her out of the house. During the incident Officer Williams' dogs managed to escape from the house. Officer Williams grabbed █████ by the neck and told her to get out again. According to █████, Officer Williams started choking her. Both █████ and Officer Williams started to punch each other, and they started to fight. █████ told Officer Williams that she was going to call the police and Officer Williams snatched █████ phone and punched █████ in the nose. █████ nose started to bleed. █████ stated her lip was swollen too. Officer Williams gave █████ a towel and then she asked █████ to help her find her dogs. Officer Williams and █████ both left the house to go find the dogs. Both of them found one dog each and then returned back to Officer Williams' house.

Once inside the house, █████ went to the bathroom to fix herself up. Officer Williams told █████ that her arm was hurting. Officer Williams told █████ to get out again and █████ told her she would leave once she gets herself together. Officer Williams and █████ started to argue again. Officer Williams grabbed █████ arms and they started to fight again. Officer Williams told █████ that she was about to call the police. █████ asked for the jersey again and █████ went to the closet to get the jersey. Officer Williams started punching █████ again and punched her in her nose again and in her stomach. █████ nose started to bleed again. Officer Williams grabbed her phone and called the police. Officer Williams and █████ continued to fight.

When the police arrived, they knocked on the door but neither Officer Williams nor █████ went to the door because they were still arguing and holding on to each other. According to █████, she let Officer Williams go so she could go answer the door for the police. The officers broke the glass door and they entered the apartment with tasers out. The officers ordered █████ to get on the floor and placed her in handcuffs. Officers asked █████ what happened, and she told them. The officers also asked █████ if she needed an ambulance and she stated probably so. Firefighters arrived and asked █████ if she needed to go to the hospital, but █████ declined to go to the hospital and stated she just needed some ice. A sergeant entered the kitchen and told officers that █████ was coming with them. Officers gave █████ her shoes and placed her inside the squad vehicle. █████ asked the officers what was going on and they told her that she was going with them. Officers transported █████ to the district. According to █████, no evidence technicians took any pictures of her. █████ stated both her cheeks were swollen and bruised. █████ also claimed that Officer Williams bite her during the incident and made a false complaint against her. █████ stated that Officer Williams kept her weapon under her pillow.

Officer Zondranika Williams was interviewed by COPA on August 6, 2020.³ Officer Williams and █████ were in a relationship but are no longer together. Officer Williams

³ Atts. 34 & 36.

met [REDACTED] sometime in the early part of 2016 while working part-time at Wal-Mart as a security guard. According to Officer Williams, she was in a relationship with [REDACTED] for less than a year. Officer Williams and [REDACTED] broke up sometime in September of 2018. Officer Williams described her relationship with [REDACTED] as a casual thing, nothing serious. Officer Williams stated that she does not deal with [REDACTED] anymore and that they are not friends. The last time Officer Williams had any contact with [REDACTED] was in April of 2020 via text messages and the conversation was regarding [REDACTED] mother passing away and Officer Williams offering her condolences. The last time Officer Williams physically saw [REDACTED] was sometime in 2019.

On December 12, 2018, at approximately 4:30pm, Officer Williams was off duty and at home. [REDACTED] came over to Officer Williams' home on that date in the mid afternoon. According to Officer Williams, [REDACTED] would not stop calling, texting and messaging her. Officer Williams stated that she felt overwhelmed by all the calls and [REDACTED] popping up at her house so she asked [REDACTED] what would make her stop and [REDACTED] told Officer Williams to just hear her out. Officer Williams invited [REDACTED] over to her home so that they could talk. Officer Williams and [REDACTED] were not in a relationship on December 12, 2018.

The conversation between Officer Williams and [REDACTED] began in Officer Williams' bedroom. According to Officer Williams, the first question [REDACTED] asked her was if she was dealing with somebody else. Officer Williams stopped and looked at [REDACTED] and told her that the conversation was over and they were not going to have that conversation and that it was time to go. [REDACTED] started to swing at Officer Williams in a playful way, Officer Williams asked [REDACTED] what she was doing and then walked out of the bedroom toward the dining room. Officer Williams stated she never hit [REDACTED], but that she did knock her hand down to prevent [REDACTED] from hitting her. Officer Williams estimated that she asked [REDACTED] to leave her home probably 50 times when they were still in the bedroom. Once Officer Williams and [REDACTED] reached the dining room, Officer Williams told [REDACTED] that she has to leave her house again. [REDACTED] told Officer Williams that she was waiting on her cousin and Officer Williams told [REDACTED] that she can wait on her cousin outside in her vehicle. [REDACTED] refused to leave and told Officer Williams that she still wants to talk. Officer Williams told [REDACTED] that she gave her an opportunity to talk but that she is talking about something that irrelevant and she asked [REDACTED] to leave again. Officer Williams took [REDACTED] coat, purse and shoes to the front door and opened the door and told [REDACTED] she had to leave again.

[REDACTED] continued to tell Officer Williams that she was waiting on her cousin. Officer Williams told [REDACTED] that she could wait outside in her car for her cousin. Officer Williams took [REDACTED] coat and shoes and sat them on the banister on the front porch. Officer Williams told [REDACTED] she can put her coat and shoes on outside. Officer Williams asked [REDACTED] to leave again and [REDACTED] started to walk up on Officer Williams as Officer Williams started to back away. According to Officer Williams, [REDACTED] started to try to hit her and she made contact a couple of times. Officer Williams estimated that [REDACTED] hit her more than ten times. However, instead of swinging back, Officer Williams grabbed her in a hug type of position and attempted to carry her

to the door. As Officer Williams attempted to carry [REDACTED] to the door, [REDACTED] placed her foot in the door. [REDACTED] also grabbed the banister near the steps causing it to detach from the wall. Officer Williams stated that she did not hit [REDACTED] back and she was just moving and knocking [REDACTED] hands down and holding her. Officer Williams stated that she never tried to swing on [REDACTED] and all she wanted was for [REDACTED] to leave.

[REDACTED] attempted to kiss Officer Williams and Officer Williams told [REDACTED] to just leave. Officer Williams released Wills and told her that she was going to call the police. As Officer Williams attempted to call the police, [REDACTED] kept knocking the phone out of her hands. [REDACTED] continued to sit on the stairs and refused to leave. According to Officer Williams, the front door was open the entire time this was going on. [REDACTED] grabbed her items off the porch and brought them back inside and she continued to sit on the steps. Officer Williams continued to ask [REDACTED] to leave but she did not leave. [REDACTED] stated she was hot then her nose started bleeding. Officer Williams noticed [REDACTED]' nose was bleeding and she gave her a towel for her nose. According to Officer Williams, [REDACTED] nose started to bleed after [REDACTED] had tussled with her. Officer Williams also admitted that she could have accidentally hit [REDACTED] in the nose while they were struggling with each other, but stated she never intentionally hit [REDACTED] in the nose.

Officer Williams noticed that her two dogs were missing. Officer Williams walked to the back of her house looking for her dogs while [REDACTED] remained at the front. Officer Williams called for the dogs at the back and then she ran upstairs and looked for them there. Officer Williams realized that at some point probably while she was holding [REDACTED] her dogs ran outside her home. Officer Williams told [REDACTED] that her dogs got out and that [REDACTED] had to leave. [REDACTED] left Officer Williams' house and got into her car. Officer Williams also grabbed her keys and got into her car to go find her dogs. According to Officer Williams, she looked for her dogs for about an hour and a half, she finally found one and then she headed back to her house. [REDACTED] arrived back to Officer Williams' house about fifteen to twenty minutes later with Officer Williams' second dog. Officer Williams never asked [REDACTED] to help her find her dogs. Officer Williams told [REDACTED] that she did not need to come back inside her home and asked her to put the dog down outside. [REDACTED] told Officer Williams that she had left something of hers inside the house. When Officer Williams opened the door to get her dog, [REDACTED] forced her way back inside the house. Officer Williams tried to prevent [REDACTED] from reentering her house by pushing her back.

Once [REDACTED] was back inside the house, she went to Officer Williams' bedroom and started taking stuff out of the closet. [REDACTED] told Officer Williams that she wanted everything she ever brought her back. Officer Williams told [REDACTED] that they are not going to play that game and she stood in front of her closet door. Officer Williams decided to call the police at that point. Officer Williams called the police and told them that she was an off-duty police officer and that

she wanted somebody out of her house. [REDACTED] and Officer Williams started to tussle⁴ because Officer Williams had called the police. [REDACTED] was pulling Officer Williams hair to prevent her from answering the door for the police. The police arrived fast according to Officer Williams and they were at the front, back and side of the house banging trying to get in. Officer Williams stated that she was screaming out to the police officers outside. Officer Williams finally got loose and ran out of the bedroom toward the dining room. When Officer Williams reached the dining room, [REDACTED] tried to attack her from behind and that is when the officers bust the glass on Officer Williams' screen door to enter the house.

At least ten officers and a sergeant entered Officer Williams' house. Officer Williams spoke to some of the officers and some of the officers spoke to [REDACTED]. Officer Williams spoke with the sergeant and told him what happened and she also showed him some reports she had against [REDACTED]. One of the officers on scene or the sergeant asked Officer Williams where her weapon was and she told them that it was secured in her closet. Officer Williams signed a complaint against [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] was arrested. Officer Williams did not have an order of protection against [REDACTED] at the time of the incident, but she stated she filed one a week after the incident because [REDACTED] continued to show up at her home and call her.

Officer Williams and [REDACTED] have another case with COPA for an incident that occurred in October of 2018. According to Officer Williams, [REDACTED] has struck her before this incident but it was nothing as extreme as this incident. Officer Williams stated she has never struck [REDACTED]. Officer Williams stated that [REDACTED] started making COPA complaints when she stopped dealing with her. Officer Williams did not begin calling the police on [REDACTED] until after the October 7, 2018 incident. Officer Williams made two police reports on [REDACTED] after the October 7, 2018 incident, one for criminal trespass and the other for simple stalking. Officer Williams also had an encounter with [REDACTED] in January of 2019 at a Target store, where [REDACTED] was the aggressor and Officer Williams had to call the police on her. Officer Williams was not injured in the December 2018 incident with [REDACTED]. Officer Williams stated there was blood on her bed in her bedroom and on her walls. Officer Williams denied ever striking [REDACTED] in the nose and she also denied telling any of the police personnel on scene that she struck [REDACTED] in the nose.

Officer Williams owns two guns, one she uses as her duty weapon and the other is her auxiliary weapon. On the date of the incident, her duty weapon was at work and her auxiliary weapon was at her home. Initially, Officer Williams denied that either of her weapons were under her pillow on the date of the incident. Officer Williams was shown a portion of one of the assisting officer's body-worn camera footage and asked again where her weapons were stored on the date of the incident. Officer Williams confirmed that the video showed her off-duty weapon under the pillow on the date of the incident and she stated that she thought it was in the closet because that is where she normally keeps it. Officer Williams stated that she has no recollection

⁴ Officer Williams was asked what she meant by "tussle" and she stated that [REDACTED] was grabbing her and trying to swing on her while she was trying to hold [REDACTED] to prevent her from swinging on her.

of putting her auxiliary weapon under the pillow on the date of the incident and that she has never stored her weapon under the pillow before. Officer Williams also stated she has never told [REDACTED] where she stores her weapons. Officer Williams denied all allegations brought against her by [REDACTED].

Sergeant Alejandro Cabral was interviewed by COPA on July 2, 2020.⁵ On the date of the incident, Sgt. Cabral was in uniform and working in the 6th District and driving a marked squad vehicle. Sgt. Cabral responded to an OEMC domestic call at the location of [REDACTED]. Sgt. Cabral was the highest-ranking department member on scene. When Sgt. Cabral arrived on scene, he exited his squad vehicle and approached the house. When he reached the front door of the house, he discovered that the front inner door was open, but the glass security door was locked. Sgt. Cabral noticed some things on the floor inside and he could hear noises coming from inside, but he could not make out anything. At some point, Sgt. Cabral and the other officers on scene started to break the outer glass door to gain entry into the house. At the same time, officers were breaking the glass; Officer Williams came to front door to open the door for the officers.

As Sgt. Cabral and the other officers on scene entered the house, Officer Williams informed them that she was an officer and that there was a second individual toward the back of the house. Some of the officers on scene went to the back of the house and Sgt. Cabral and other officers stayed at the front of the house near the living room area with Officer Williams. Officer Williams informed Sgt. Cabral that she had been in an altercation with her girlfriend⁶ and that her girlfriend was pulling her hair to keep her from coming to the door. Sgt. Cabral spoke to Officer Williams about what occurred and then he found out that [REDACTED] had a bloody nose. The fire department⁷ was already on scene, so Sgt. Cabral asked them to give [REDACTED] medical attention. [REDACTED] refused medical attention. According to Sgt. Cabral, Officer Williams told him that she had punched [REDACTED] in the nose during the altercation when she was trying to defend herself. Sgt. Cabral estimated that he spoke with Officer Williams for about five to ten minutes. Officer Williams relayed to Sgt. Cabral that there was an altercation around the front door and that [REDACTED] did not want to leave. Somehow, they ended up in the bedroom and that's when [REDACTED] was keeping Officer Williams from coming to the door by pulling her hair. Officer Williams also showed Sgt. Cabral some reports she had against [REDACTED], one for stalking and one for criminal trespass. Sgt. Cabral could not recall whether or not he spoke with [REDACTED], but he stated that if he did speak to [REDACTED], it was very briefly. Sgt. Cabral believes that other officer on scene spoke to [REDACTED] and he believes that they relayed [REDACTED] side of the story to him.

Sgt. Cabral described Officer Williams' demeanor as a little distraught. According to Sgt. Cabral, she seemed a little out of breath and either upset or scared. Sgt. Cabral did not recall

⁵ Atts. 32 & 35.

⁶ [REDACTED].

⁷ The fire department was called to help make forced entry to the house. But officers were able to enter the house before the fire department arrived to the scene.

█████ demeanor, but he stated she looked calm from what he saw on the body camera footage. Sgt. Cabral did not recall personally observing any injuries to Officer Williams, but he stated she mentioned her hair and arm being pulled on the body camera footage. Sgt. Cabral does not remember observing any blood at the scene. Sgt. Cabral does not recall who made the decision to arrest █████, but he stated that Officer Williams signed complaints on her. █████ was arrested for battery, physical contact. According to Sgt. Cabral, Officer Williams was not arrested because █████ was the aggressor, Officer Williams was the caller and she had prior reports on █████. Officer Williams also relayed to Sgt. Cabral that █████ pulled her hair and kept her from coming to the door. Sgt. Cabral did not ask █████ if she had any prior reports on Officer Williams. According to Sgt. Cabral, on most domestic calls he responds to, he goes to the caller first which in this case was Officer Williams.

Sgt. Cabral did not generate a log number for the incident between Officer Williams and █████. According to Sgt. Cabral, he did not generate a log number because he believed that no allegation of misconduct had been made. Sgt. Cabral also stated that as he prepared for his statement with COPA and reread the general order, he could see why he should have generated a log number and he will do so in the future. Sgt. Cabral did not call an evidence technician to the scene because he determined that there was nothing that needed to be photographed. Sgt. Cabral described the investigate steps he took as, responding to the scene, trying to gain entry and trying to figure out what was going on. Sgt. Cabral stated that he could hear noises and dogs barking. As they started to make entry Officer Williams came to the door. Sgt. Cabral asked the firefighters on scene to treat █████ for her bloody nose and then he attempted to get information from Officer Williams about what occurred at the house. Officer Williams showed Sgt. Cabral previous reports that she had filed on █████ and Sgt. Cabral offered her advice as to how to proceed on those reports and get an order of protection. Sgt. Cabral feels that he did do a thorough investigation based on the information he had at the time.

b. Digital Evidence⁸

Sgt. Alejandro Cabral body-worn camera (bwc) depicts him inside his squad vehicle, he exits the vehicle and walks up to the scene.⁹ Sgt. Cabral knocks on the screen door and twists the knob but the screen door is locked.¹⁰ Sgt. Cabral tells another officer to go check the back. Sgt. Cabral walks around to the side of the residence and knocks on a window. He then walks to the other side of the residence and knocks on a side door. Sgt. Cabral then goes back to the front of the house and knocks on the screen door again. Sgt. Cabral asks one of the officers if he hears yelling in the back and asks him what he is hearing. Sgt. Cabral knocks on the screen door harder and there is still no answer.

⁸There were multiple officers on scene with their body-worn cameras activated; only the most relevant one are included in this SRI as to not be repetitive.

⁹Att. 19.

¹⁰The front door to the home is wide open but the screen door is locked.

Sgt. Cabral goes back to the side of the residence and knocks on the window again. Sgt. Cabral returns back to the front of the house and he tells another officer to call fire. An officer on scene begins to break the screen door glass as Officer Williams is coming to the door to unlock it. Officer Williams puts her hands up and tells the officers that she is the police. Sgt. Cabral asks Officer Williams where [REDACTED] is, and Officer Williams tells him. One of the officers tells Sgt. Cabral that he is going to go tase [REDACTED] and Officer Williams tells the officer not to tase her.

Sgt. Cabral asks Officer Williams for her name and he asks her if she has her weapon on her. Officer Williams tell him the weapon is in the room. Sgt. Cabrel pulls an item out of Officer Williams' pants and she tells him that it is a jersey. Sgt. Cabral asks Officer Williams what happened. Officer Williams starts to tell Sgt. Cabral what happened. Officer Williams tells Sgt. Cabral that [REDACTED] came over and started talking about other people and then [REDACTED] started to hit her. Officer Williams tells the sergeant that she got up and asked [REDACTED] to leave, but [REDACTED] refused to leave. Officer Williams says she gets [REDACTED] coat and placed it outside and told [REDACTED] to leave again. Officer Williams tells the sergeant that [REDACTED] started to tear up her house. She tells the sergeant that [REDACTED] grabbed her hair and in the process of trying to get loose, [REDACTED] nose started to bleed. Officer Williams tells the sergeant that they were wrestling by the door and that her dogs got out and both of them left to go find the dogs. When [REDACTED] came back to the house to bring the dog back and to get her stuff she refused to leave again. Officer Williams tells the sergeant that [REDACTED] kept knocking the phone out her hands when she tried to call the police. Officer Williams also tells the sergeant that [REDACTED] kept grabbing her hair and would not let her answer the door when officers arrived. Officer Williams also mentions something about her arm being hurt. Officer Williams tells the sergeant that she has been messing with Wills for two years. Sgt. Cabral sends another officer to go look at [REDACTED] to see if she was still bleeding. Firefighters arrive and Sgt. Cabral tells them to go look at [REDACTED] because she is bleeding from the nose and that she might be going to jail.

Sgt. Cabral asks Officer Williams for her CPD identification and asks where she works. You can see other officers speaking with [REDACTED] in the back of the house. Sgt. Cabral calls one of the other officers over to him and asks him what [REDACTED] told him. Officer Williams goes outside to retrieve some paperwork from her vehicle. Sgt. Cabral asks Officer Williams if she has an order of protection and Officer Williams tells him no. Sgt. Cabral tells Officer Williams that [REDACTED] is alleging that she hit her in the nose and Officer Williams tells Sgt. Cabral that happened in the struggle. Sgt. Cabral tells Officer Williams that she called and that they saw [REDACTED] coming after her so [REDACTED] is going to get arrested. Sgt. Cabral asks Officer Williams if she is going to sign complainants and she tells him yes.

Officer Rafael Altamirano body-worn camera (bwc) depicts him arriving to the scene.¹¹ An officer on scene can be heard knocking on the screen door to Officer Williams'

¹¹ Att. 18.

house. Officer Altamirano knocks on the side window. Officer Altamirano tells Sergeant Cabral that another officer heard yelling inside the house. Officers continue to knock on the screen door. Officers finally break the glass to the screen door. Sergeant Cabral and the other officers on scene enter the house. Officer Williams can be heard telling the officers that she is the police. Other officers order █████ down to the ground and they place her in handcuffs.

Officers on scene ask █████ what happened and she tells them. █████ tells the officers that Officer Williams called her over so they could talk and they started arguing and then Officer Williams started to fight her. █████ tells the officers that Officer Williams busted her nose by hitting her in the nose. Sergeant Cabral asks Officer Williams what happened and Officer Williams tells the sergeant that █████ came over and started talking about other people and then started hitting her. Officer Williams states that she asked █████ to leave but she would not leave. Officer Williams tells the officers that the blood on her shirt is █████. █████ tells Officer Altamirano that Officer Williams did ask her to leave but that she did not because they always tussle. █████ also tells the officer that they heard the officers knocking but they did not answer the door because they were tussling.

Firefighters arrive and check out █████ face, █████ declines to go to the hospital. █████ tells Officer Altamirano that at first they were joking around and that she did hit Officer Williams first but they were playing when she did that. █████ stated that they first started fighting by the door and Officer Williams asked her to leave but she did not leave because she wanted the jersey back that she had brought Officer Williams. █████ tells the officer that they left the house to go find the dogs and then when they got back from finding the dogs they started fighting again. Officer Altamirano walks away from █████. Somebody asks where Officer Williams' weapon is and Officer Altamirano goes into the bedroom at 22:42 and raises up the pillow and a black handgun is under the pillow. Officer Williams tells Officer Altamirano that she has several reports against █████ from previous incidents.

Officer John Obrien body-worn camera (bwc) depicts officers trying to gain access to Officer Williams' residence.¹² Once inside, Officer Obrien immediately orders █████ down to the ground and places handcuffs on her. He asks █████ what happened. █████ tells the officer that they were dating and that Officer Williams texted her to come over so they could talk. Officer Obrien asks █████ about the blood in the house and she tells him it is from her nose and Officer Williams busted her nose by hitting her. █████ also tells the officer that Officer Williams took her phone when she told her she was going to call the police. █████ tells the officer that there is a previous COPA case. █████ tells the officer that she arrived at Officer Williams' house at 1pm. █████ admits that Officer Williams asked her to leave and she did not, and they started tussling. █████ tells the officer they both left the house after the dogs got out and then they came back to the house. █████ also tells the officer that they were tussling when officers were at the door. The ambulance arrived and █████ informed them that she was hit in her nose. The officer

¹²Att. 21.

asked █████ where Officer Williams keeps her firearms and █████ tells the officer under the pillow. █████ was asked if she wanted to sign complaints against Officer Williams and she declined. █████ states she just wants her apple watch back and her jersey.

c. Documentary Evidence

Arrest report and Original Case Incident Report (JB550566) document █████ was arrested on December 12, 2018 for domestic battery.¹³ According to the narrative, officers were dispatched to a domestic disturbance. When officers arrived, the front door was open, but the screen door was locked. Upon knocking on the window, officers could hear Williams yelling on the inside but could not make out what she was saying. Officers finally made entry through the front door; Williams ran toward officers the officers wearing a bloody t-shirt stating that she got into a fist fight with █████. Officers placed █████ into handcuffs and detained her. Williams told the officers that she invited █████ over to talk and when she asked █████ to leave, she refused. Williams called the police to have █████ removed from her house. Officers did note that █████ nose was bleeding and that she refused medical attention.

d. Additional Evidence

Officer Williams requested and was granted an order of protection against █████ on December 21, 2018.¹⁴

VI. LEGAL STANDARD

For each Allegation COPA must make one of the following findings:

1. Sustained - where it is determined the allegation is supported by a preponderance of the evidence;
2. Not Sustained - where it is determined there is insufficient evidence to prove the allegations by a preponderance of the evidence;
3. Unfounded - where it is determined by clear and convincing evidence that an allegation is false or not factual; or
4. Exonerated - where it is determined by clear and convincing evidence that the conduct described in the allegation occurred, but it is lawful and proper.

A **preponderance of evidence** can be described as evidence indicating that it is **more likely than not** that the conduct reviewed complied with Department policy. *See Avery v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co.*, 216 Ill. 2d 100, 191 (2005), (a proposition is proved by a preponderance of the evidence when it has found to be more probably true than not). If the evidence gathered in an

¹³ Atts. 5 & 6.

¹⁴ Att. 3.

investigation establishes that it is more likely that the conduct complied with Department policy than that it did not, even if by a narrow margin, then the preponderance of the evidence standard is met.

Clear and convincing evidence is a higher standard than a preponderance of the evidence but lower than the "beyond-a-reasonable doubt" standard required to convict a person of a criminal offense. See *e.g., People v. Coan*, 2016 IL App (2d) 151036 (2016). Clear and Convincing can be defined as a "degree of proof, which, considering all the evidence in the case, produces the firm and abiding belief that it is highly probable that the proposition . . . is true." *Id.* at ¶ 28.

VII. ANALYSIS

Sergeant Alejandro Cabral

COPA makes a finding of **Sustained** for **allegation #1 and #2** against Sergeant Cabral, in that he failed to generate a log number and he failed to properly notify COPA of the domestic incident. Special Order S04-04, Section 3, B4 outlines the responsibilities of the Bureau of Patrol field supervisor. According to the special order, the field supervisor is required to obtain a CR number and follow the procedures outlined in the Department directive entitled complainant and disciplinary procedures if a department member is involved in the domestic incident and a crime/misconduct by the Department member is alleged. In the present incident, ██████ alleged that Officer Williams hit her in the nose. ██████ told officers on scene the day of the incident that Officer Williams hit her in the nose and Sergeant Cabral was aware that ██████ was injured. According to Sergeant Cabral, Officer Williams also told him that she punched ██████ in the nose during the struggle. Sergeant Cabral admitted during his interview with COPA that he did not generate a log number for the incident because he believed that no allegation of misconduct had been made. Sergeant Cabral also stated that after rereading the order he understands why he should have generated a log number and he will do so in the future. As such, COPA makes a finding of Sustained for both allegations.

COPA makes a finding of **Not Sustained** for **allegation #3** against Sergeant Cabral, in that he failed to request an evidence technician. General Order G04-04 deals with domestic incident and Department members responsibilities when it comes to responding to them. General Order G04-04, Section IV-A3 details that the Bureau of Patrol is responsible for identifying the crime scene and determining whether there is any evidence present. If there is visible injury to the victim or physical evidence of the crime which requires processing, Department members will notify their supervisor and request an evidence technician. In the present case neither the sergeant nor the officers present called an evidence technician to the scene. Sergeant Cabral stated during his COPA interview that he did not call an evidence technician to the scene because there was nothing that needed to be photographed. The general order states that the department members present at the scene are the ones who determine if an evidence technician is required. In the present case Sergeant Cabral determined that there was no evidence present that needed to be photograph even though ██████ was injured. There were also other department members on the scene who decided not to call an evidence technician. As such, COPA makes a finding of Not Sustained for this allegation.

COPA makes a finding of **Not Sustained** for **allegation #4** against Sergeant Cabral, in that he failed to conduct a thorough investigation. General Order G04-04, Section IV-A1 details that the Bureau of Patrol is responsible for conducting the preliminary investigation and officers will conduct a thorough investigation, including identifying and interviewing all involved parties separately. In the present case, Sergeant Cabral interviewed Officer Williams, while other officers on scene interviewed [REDACTED]. Sergeant Cabral could not recall whether he personally spoke with [REDACTED] but he believes that other officer on scene spoke to [REDACTED] and relayed [REDACTED]' side of the story to him. Body-worn camera footage shows officers on scene speaking with [REDACTED] and getting her side of what occurred. Body-worn camera footage also shows Sergeant Cabral speaking with Officer Williams. The officers who spoke to [REDACTED] relayed to Sergeant Cabral [REDACTED]' side of the story, but Sergeant Cabral never actually spoke to [REDACTED]. As such, COPA makes a finding of Not Sustained for this allegation.

Officer Zondranika Williams

COPA makes a finding of **Sustained** for **allegation #1** against Officer Williams, in that she punched [REDACTED] in the nose without justification. On the date of the incident, Officer Williams and [REDACTED] were involved in a domestic altercation. During this altercation, [REDACTED] received an injury to her nose. [REDACTED] told responding officers that Officer Williams had punched her in the nose causing her injury. There was blood present at Officer Williams' home and on Officer Williams' tee-shirt; Officer Williams told the responding officers that the blood on her shirt was [REDACTED]. In an interview with COPA, Sergeant Cabral told COPA that Officer Williams admitted to him that she punched [REDACTED] in the nose when she was trying to defend herself. [REDACTED] also told COPA during her interview that Officer Williams punched her in the nose on the date of the incident. Officer Williams denies intentionally punching [REDACTED] in the nose, but she does admit that she could have accidentally struck [REDACTED] in the nose during their struggle. Rule 9 prevents officers from engaging in any unjustified verbal or physical altercation with any person, while on or off duty. As such, COPA makes a finding of Sustained for this allegation.

COPA makes a finding of **Not Sustained** for allegations #2 and #3 against Officer Williams, in that she bit [REDACTED]' hands and choked [REDACTED] without justification. In a statement to COPA, [REDACTED] alleged that Officer Williams bit her on the hand and choked her during their altercation. In Officer Williams' statement to COPA she denied biting [REDACTED] on the hand and choking [REDACTED]. [REDACTED] also made no mention of Officer Williams biting her hands or choking her to the arriving officers on the date of the incident. There is no video footage from the date of the incident that captured the actual incident and there are no independent witnesses who witness the interaction between Officer Williams and [REDACTED]. As such, COPA makes a finding of Not Sustained for these allegations.

COPA makes a finding of **Sustained** for **allegation #4 and #5** against Officer Williams, in that she engaged in an unjustified verbal and physical altercation with [REDACTED]. On the date of the incident, Officer Williams allowed [REDACTED] into her house. [REDACTED] arrived sometime in the early afternoon time and police did not arrive to Officer Williams' home until approximately 4:30pm. Officer Williams stated that not long after [REDACTED] arrived, [REDACTED] started asking her questions that she did not want to answer, and she asked [REDACTED] to leave. Officer Williams told COPA that [REDACTED]

refused to leave and started hitting her but that she did not hit [REDACTED] back. In her statement to COPA, [REDACTED] admitted that she and Officer Williams were fighting on the date of the incident. She told COPA that they started arguing over somebody calling her phone and then it escalated from there. [REDACTED] also admitted to hitting Officer Williams first, although it was in a playful manner. On the date of the incident, Officer Williams told Sergeant Cabral that she and [REDACTED] were wrestling. According to Sergeant Cabral, Officer Williams also told him that [REDACTED] nose got busted during the struggle. [REDACTED] also received an injury to her nose that was caused by Officer Williams. As such, COPA makes a finding of Sustained for these allegations.

COPA makes a finding of **Not Sustained** for **allegation #6** against Officer Williams, in that she obstructed [REDACTED] from calling for emergency assistance by taking her phone. In a statement to COPA, [REDACTED] alleged that Officer Williams prevented her from calling the police. Officer Williams denied the allegation and ultimately, she was the one that called the police. Officer Williams and [REDACTED] were the only two people inside the home during the incident and there were no cameras inside the residence that captured the incident. As such, COPA makes a finding of Not Sustained for this allegation.

COPA makes a finding of **Not Sustained** for allegation #7 against Officer Williams, in that she had [REDACTED] arrested without justification. Officer Williams called the police on [REDACTED] and she asserted that [REDACTED] was the one that was hitting her. In her interview with COPA, [REDACTED] admitted that she started hitting Officer Williams first, in a playful manner. [REDACTED] also told COPA that Officer Williams asked her to leave multiple times but that she did not leave. Sergeant Cabral does not remember who made the decision to arrest [REDACTED] but stated that Officer Williams signed complaints on [REDACTED]. As such, COPA makes a finding of Not Sustained for this allegation.

COPA makes a finding of **Sustained** for allegation #8 against Officer Williams, in that she failed to properly secure her weapon. Uniform and Property U04-02, Section II-M states sworn members are to secure all firearms which they own or possess, in a manner that a reasonable person would believe will prohibit access by unapproved individuals, theft, or loss. In the present case, Officer Williams' weapon was stored under her pillow where [REDACTED] had access to it. [REDACTED] was in Officer Williams' bedroom when she first came over; this was confirmed through Officer Williams' statement to COPA. Arriving officers also asked [REDACTED] where Officer Williams' weapon was, and she told them that it was under the pillow. Body-worn camera footage also depicts officers going into Officer Williams' bedroom and lifting a pillow to reveal Officer Williams' weapon. As such, COPA makes a finding of Sustained for this allegation.

VIII. RECOMMENDED DISCIPLINE FOR SUSTAINED ALLEGATIONS

a. Sergeant Alejandro Cabral

Two allegations against Sergeant Cabral are sustained. In determining what form of discipline to recommend, COPA considered the officer's training, disciplinary and complimentary history: Sergeant Cabral has been a sworn member of CPD since 2006. He does not have a history of

disciple. Sergeant Cabral did not make the proper notifications in this matter. COPA recommends Sergeant Cabral receive a Reprimand for the sustained allegations.

b. Officer Zondranika Williams

Four allegations against Officer Williams are sustained. In determining what form of discipline to recommend, COPA considered the officer’s training, disciplinary and complimentary history: Officer Williams has been a sworn member of CPD since 2015. Her disciplinary history shows that she received a reprimand for Inadequate/Failure to Provide Service April 20, 2018.

Due to the seriousness of the allegations sustained against Officer Williams, COPA recommends she receive a 5-day Suspension.

IX. CONCLUSION

Based on the analysis set forth above, COPA makes the following findings:

Officer	Allegation	Finding / Recommendation
Sergeant Alejandro Cabral	It is alleged by COPA by and through Deputy Chief Angela Hearts-Glass, that on or about December 12, 2018, at or after 5:30pm, at or near [REDACTED], Sgt. Alejandro Cabral, star 1286, committed misconduct through the following act or omission, by: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. failing to generate a log number for a domestic incident involving Officer Zondranika Williams and [REDACTED], in violation of rule 5. 2. failing to properly notify COPA, for a domestic incident involving Officer Zondranika Williams and [REDACTED], as required, in violation of rule 5. 3. failing to request an evidence technician for a domestic incident involving Officer Zondranika Williams and [REDACTED], in violation of rule 5. 4. failing to conduct a thorough investigation for a domestic incident involving Officer Zondranika Williams and [REDACTED], in violation of rule 5. 	Sustained/ Reprimand Sustained/ Reprimand Not Sustained Not Sustained
Officer Zondranika Williams	It is alleged by [REDACTED] that on or about December 12, 2018, at approximately 4:30pm, at or near [REDACTED], Officer Zondranika Williams, star 16267, committed misconduct through the following act or omission, by: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. punching [REDACTED] in the nose, without 	

justification, in violation of rule 9.	Sustained/ 5-day Suspension
2. biting [REDACTED] on her hands, without justification, in violation of rule 9.	Not Sustained
3. choking [REDACTED], without justification, in violation of rule 9.	Not Sustained
4. engaging in an unjustified physical altercation with [REDACTED] in violation of rule 9.	Sustained / 5-day Suspension
5. engaging in an unjustified verbal altercation with [REDACTED], in violation of rule 9.	Sustained / 5-day Suspension
6. obstructing [REDACTED] from calling for emergency assistance by taking her phone, in violation of rule 9.	Not Sustained
7. having [REDACTED] arrested, without justification, in violation of rule 2.	Not Sustained
8. failing to properly secure your weapon, in violation of rule 13.	Sustained / 5-day Suspension

Approved:

[REDACTED]

10/27/20

James Murphy-Aguilu
Deputy Chief Administrator – Chief Investigator

Date

Appendix A

Assigned Investigative Staff

Squad#:	5
Investigator:	[REDACTED]
Supervising Investigator:	[REDACTED]
Deputy Chief Administrator:	James Murphy-Aguilu